gov't

Journal of Administration Overseas

DARTMOUTH COLLEGE
MAR 8 1973
LIBRARY

Volume XII/Number 1/January 1973

Price 32½p quarterly net; annual subscription including postage £1.50

INCLUDING

Removing Administrative and Planning Constraints to Development
by Donald C. Stone

The Role of Local Government in Economic Development in Africa
by Samuel Humes

Local Government Reform in the Sudan
by John Howell

Techniques for teaching Public Administration
by Hubert Allen

The Ombudsman in Tanzania
by Mark Kimicha

BOOK REVIEWS
by Dr. Richard Jolly, K. I. Meek,
Professor Bryan Keith-Lucas, Dr. Philip Mawhood,
Ken Davey, J. M. Gullick

Published for the Foreign and Commonwealth Office,
Overseas Development Administration

HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE

This *Journal* is edited in the Social Affairs Department of the Foreign and Commonwealth Office Overseas Development Administration. It aims at providing a medium for the exchange of information about administration at all levels, whether in local government or in the organization of central departments. It also covers land tenure. Nothing in the *Journal* should be read as necessarily representing official views or policy unless this is specifically stated. The responsibility for facts and opinions expressed in signed articles rests with the authors.

NOTES TO CONTRIBUTORS

Articles for publication in the *Journal* from serving officers and others with knowledge and experience in the field covered by the *Journal* are welcome and should be addressed to the Editor, Social Affairs Department, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, Overseas Development Administration, Eland House, Stag Place, Victoria, London SW1E 5DH.

Books for review, reports and communications for the Editor should be similarly addressed.

Twenty off-prints are supplied free of charge on request to contributors whose articles are published. Requests for off-prints should be made at the time articles are submitted. Off-prints in excess of twenty are charged for at a rate relative to the length of the article.

Orders and subscriptions should be sent to Her Majesty's Stationery Office at the addresses given below.

The Government does not accept responsibility for any of the
private or trade advertisements included in this publication

Published by
HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
49 High Holborn, London WC1V 6HB

13a Castle St., Edinburgh EH2 3AR
Brazennose St., Manchester M60 8AS
258 Broad St., Birmingham B1 2HE
109 St Mary St., Cardiff CF1 1JW
50 Fairfax St., Bristol BS1 3DE
80 Chichester St., Belfast BT1 4JY
or through booksellers

Price 32½p net, annual subscription including postage, £1.50

© *Crown copyright* 1973

Journal of Administration Overseas

VOLUME XII/NUMBER 1/JANUARY 1973

Contents

Editor's Notes 3

Removing Administrative and Planning Constraints to Development
by Donald C. Stone 4

The Role of Local Government in Economic Development in Africa
by Samuel Humes 21

Local Government Reform in the Sudan
by John Howell 28

The Use of "In-Basket" Exercises and Similar Techniques for Teaching Public Administration 37
by Hubert Allen

The Ombudsman and the Permanent Commission of Enquiry
by Mark Kimicha 46

Quarterly Notes: 51
  Urbanization in the Second Development Decade
  Conference of New Zealand Town Clerks
  A new Journal, "Local Finance"
  Administrative Training in Papua New Guinea
  Ombudsman for British Local Government
  Urban Information Services in the USA
  Empire State College in the USA
  Special Programme in Urban Development Planning

Book Reviews 60

Book Notes 75

Editor's Notes

"If everything else is done and public administration fails, all fails"
(Clarence L. Blau)

SINCE the phrase "development administration" was coined to describe public administration in newly independent countries with the focus on economic and social development, Professor Donald C. Stone, in the counsels of high level international and academic bodies, has been one of the most prominent advocates of administrative reform geared to the needs of the countries of the Third World. We are, therefore, particularly happy that Professor Stone has specially prepared an article for this Number in which he looks at the administrative constraints on development, suggests remedial measures, sets out the initiatives undertaken by the United Nations and calls for adequate funds for public service education and research.

While Professor Stone examines the wider problems of administration, Professor Humes focuses on those at local level on the continent of Africa. He suggests that instead of unhelpful central/local competitiveness, a new complementary relationship might be developed better were one official, acting both as Central Agent and local Chief Executive, made responsible for co-ordinating all the central/local efforts in the field in each rural district. The inter-dependent need for developing local institutions can be too easily overlooked and Professor Humes would like to see "renewed concern for . . . representative and responsible institutions of government at the local level".

Professor Humes' philosophy leads to the actualities of African local government as evidenced by John Howell's study of the present situation in the Sudan, where the High Executive Council "regulates the machinery of local government". To the author, "perhaps the most far-reaching changes in the government and the politics of the Sudan are likely to come with the implementation of the 1971 Peoples Local Government Act". Essential decentralization away from Khartoum may, it seems, lead to over-centralization at Provincial level. At the Centre, financial stringency and a reluctance to provide the resources needed locally, place at least for the time being a major constraint on the devolution of power to local authorities.

After the theory of public administration at national and local level and the manner in which it has been developed in practice in one African country, it is appropriate to look at the methods of administrative training used in teaching those who are to administer the machinery of central and local government. Hubert Allen's exposition of "In-basket" exercises sets out one technique that is available and how this works will, we hope, be of value to some of those engaged in teaching public administration at various institutions in scattered and distant centres overseas.

Finally and, in a sense, over all—the Citizens' Watch-dog. Mr. Justice Kimicha provides a brief picture of the Ombudsman as he operates in Tanzania. Here, the Ombudsman has reasonably informal procedures to follow, is able to keep in reach of the rural peasantry and he reports direct to the President whose "pen has not spared even cabinet ministers": this no doubt is one reason for confidence in the system adopted in Tanzania.

Removing Administrative and Planning Constraints to Development

By DONALD C. STONE

Donald C. Stone is Dean Emeritus and Professor of Public and International Affairs at the University of Pittsburgh; he has served as an official and consultant of numerous local, regional, national, and international agencies, including bilateral and multilateral development assistance agencies.

IF developing countries had been extended as much technical co-operation for improving their administrative systems to plan and implement development programmes and projects as was provided for economic planning, their achievements in attaining development goals would have been far greater. In this paper I shall endeavour to suggest measures which development assistance organizations and governments working together can take to remove administrative constraints while increasing their administrative capability for development. It is written to stimulate action by and elicit views from planners, administrators, educators, and advisers concerned with development achievement.

I. Planning for Implementation

From the beginning of bilateral and multilateral technical assistance following World War II, excessive reliance has been placed on the application of macro-economic models as the key to national development, and not enough on operational and administrative requisites. Economic planning techniques, initially developed under the Marshall Plan to serve countries with mature administrative infrastructure, did not prove sufficient for newly independent and other low-income countries.

Contributory to this limited orientation of development planning during the 1950s and the sixties was the almost exclusive use of economists to assist countries in formulating development plans and a corresponding assignment of staff of development planning agencies for participant training to study in economics faculties of Western universities. As a result many development plans have not contained non-economic elements essential to their implementation, nor have administrative systems been sufficiently reoriented to tasks of implementation. I have frequently encountered the assumption that sound economic policies are self-realizing. The adequacy of the governmental administrative system has too often been taken for granted. These limited approaches are rapidly changing in the wake of disappointing results.

A view in the 1960s. In 1963 I visited twelve countries in Asia, the Middle East, Africa, and Latin America, to determine why development was not taking place more rapidly and what should and can be done. In a private report I listed these two among a score of findings:

> Most development plans are largely "non-functional", they do not

incorporate the measures, organizations, procedures, and other elements essential to their implementation.

> Planning agencies lack personnel sufficiently concerned with the political and administrative measures and organizational and operating requirements for implementation. Plans are often mainly aspirations or hopeful statistical projections. They lack the solid supporting instruments of approved policies, financial measures, programmes and projects, and administrative commitments.

This does not imply that productive planning was not accomplished. Much good work was going on and after the end of this first development decade, the score showed a 5½ per cent average growth rate in the developing countries as compared with the target of 5 per cent. This despite trade restrictions by developed countries, inflation, and other obstacles.

The point is that far greater progress in social objectives and in performance of sector programmes could have taken place if essential administrative, managerial, and co-ordinating requisites had been built into the planning process – both centrally and in the ministries, and also in the regions and large urban centres.

Recent assessment. In several postgraduate seminars my students have analyzed the medium term (e.g. 4 to 6 year) development plans of their home countries, or some selected country, to determine the extent to which they have incorporated policies and measures essential to implementation. Many of the students have been officials on assignment from developing countries. Their reports confirm what I have observed over the years, namely that most development plans are largely confined to macro or aggregate economic goal and policy planning.

This limited character of planning is illustrated by the following comment of one student, an engineering official of a small country in the Western hemisphere:

> There is a planning unit in the Ministry of Finance. However, this is made up solely of economists, and their plans read like political manifestos. They do not use the resources of the ministries with their technical personnel. What is planned is rarely compatible with what is achieved because of this lack of information and co-ordination. They have not mastered short-term planning, yet they are trying long-term planning.

Another student has this to say regarding a plan of a country in Asia which received much technical assistance for its planning board.

> It is exclusively a plan for economic development. Little consideration is given to social or physical development . . . Priorities and activities are defined, but plans for implementation are generally not specific . . . There is a shortcoming in specifying revenue for particular programmes . . . None of the sector plans provide adequately planned programmes to carry out objectives.

Broader concepts. This urgency for a broader approach to development planning is implicit in an excellent discussion paper prepared by Dr. Chi-Yuen

Wu for a U.N. interregional seminar. He makes the following introductory points which he subsequently develops in detail:

> Co-ordination is one of the most basic and yet often neglected elements in development planning. To co-ordinate means to bring various parts into proper relations, to establish consistency in decisions, to ensure unity of action, to adopt an integrated or balanced approach to problems, or to harmonize policies and activities to achieve desired objectives . . . To plan means to formulate a programme of action for achieving certain goal(s) or objective(s), to work out (in broad outline or in detail) the things that need to be done and the methods for doing them, and, to be effective, also to design beforehand a scheme for an orderly arrangement of the various parts necessary for achieving the objective(s). Effective planning is by nature a co-ordinating and co-ordinative action. In a strict sense, "unco-ordinated planning" is a contradiction in terms.[1]

Tested by Dr. Wu's criteria much of what is often referred to as development planning by Western planners is only a part of the task. The application of macro-economic or econometric models may have great value, but standing alone this falls far short of the kind of planning essential to achieve the social and physical well-being of developing countries. Planning in industrialized, high-income countries offers little relevant experience.

Dr. Wu provides an important insight when he goes on to say "the term 'plan' or 'planning' is used so loosely that in many important books on development planning by leading authors one can find only one or two references to co-ordination (or even none) in the table of contents or the subject index". I commend reading the entire paper.

Supported by definitive programmes. Among the steps to strengthen the operational quality of development plans, none is more important than the formulation, evaluation, and selection of definitive programmes and projects essential to the achievement of specific and aggregate goals. This requires active involvement of the ministries, agencies, and public enterprises responsible for implementation as partners in sectoral planning, including preparation of the essential programme and operational components. Projects require evaluation of their administrative and operational feasibility as well as economic potential.

A nation's comprehensive plan obviously cannot include much detail, but should it not at least specify the principal measures, policies, programmes, and projects proposed to achieve the specified purposes? At a minimum plans should give assurance that clearly defined undertakings have been prepared by the administering agencies and that there are sufficient resources and operational capabilities to carry them out. Such collaboration between central planning offices and operating agencies appears to be increasing.

Regional and urban planning. This partnership aspect of planning also applies to regional governments (e.g. provinces and states) and municipalities.

---

[1] Co-ordination and Harmonization in Development Planning, prepared for the Interregional Seminar on Organization and Administration of Development Planning Agencies, Kiev, 16-25 October 1972 (ESA/PA/AC.1/2).

Regional and local development have become major components in a nation's development. Urban development with its physical and social infrastructure is a crucial factor in industrial development as well as an essential response to producing a better life in a time of accelerated growth of cities.

My students searched for evidences of such components in current comprehensive plans. Their scarcity suggests that many development planning bodies have overlooked the importance of regional and local government inputs in national development. Should not national plans include some indication of regional and municipal goals, programmes, and funding? Annexed or supplemental plans may deal more specifically with scheduled projects.

Integrated planning and budgeting. Another step to strengthen plan implementation is to link annual budgets for capital and current expenses with the planning process. Without this, resources will not be utilized effectively for plan execution. Many budgets cover only general revenues and appropriations. Other kinds of income, earnings, and funds may be expended entirely outside the budget system, and for purposes inconsistent with development objectives.

In addition to discussion and statistics regarding sources of funding, few development plans give assurance that resources will be available for the designated purposes. Unless the revenue measures, appropriations, and other authorizing instruments are defined as a part of plan approval, funds for implementation may be diverted to other uses or otherwise not become available when needed. Unified programme planning and budgeting within ministries and other agencies will facilitate and support integrated planning and budgeting of all resources by the government as a whole.

In most countries budgeting is under the control of a ministry of finance while development planning is assigned either to a special ministry or preferably to a central unit in the prime minister's or president's office. When subordinated in a finance ministry, budgeting tends to be treated as a fiscal/accounting process and consequently fails to fulfil its executive management potential as a policy planning and programming instrument. These two processes or instruments need to be brought into effective relationship and work co-operatively with each other and with other ministries and agencies.

Administrative improvement. Administrative planning to develop implementing organizations and systems should similarly parallel and be integrated with development planning. Otherwise, the necessary instrumentalities and measures essential for execution of policies, programmes, and projects will not have been worked out and there will be fumbling and floundering. This can be accomplished either by broadening the mandate of the development planning office as an arm of the nation's chief executive or by establishing a parallel and complementary office for administrative management planning. Many administrative reform efforts appear to take place independent of economic and social planning and of decisions regarding development goals and processes.

To the extent feasible, development plans should incorporate the administrative measures, processes, and arrangements essential to implementation of economic, social, and production goals. It is recognized that inclusion of proposals for administrative reorganization and other administrative changes in development plans for consideration of legislative bodies might create insuperable obstacles to their achievement. Many administrative reforms must be handled within the executive branch in a manner to avoid self-serving opposition.

Manpower and research planning. Determination of manpower availabilities and needs is a comparable aspect of development to that of assessment and utilization of physical and financial resources. Countries are giving increasing attention to inventorying their human resources, projecting requirements for various occupational categories, and planning educational programmes to produce the additional kinds and numbers of persons needed.

Unfortunately, these efforts seem to be confined largely to traditional occupational categories commonly utilized in census and statistical systems. New and expanding government operations, services, and enterprises necessitate new categories or classifications for public service manpower and educational planning. For example, Tanzania makes projections of the types and numbers of administrative and specialized professional and technical persons required for the nation's public services. Only with such information is it possible to adjust or create training institutions to produce required talent. Are there other development plans which include a public service manpower programme?

Execution of development plans similarly calls for measures to produce essential operational knowledge and techniques. These include planned efforts to stimulate the application of science and technology. They consist also of action-oriented research to remove administrative constraints to development and to design the organizations, delivery systems, and other institutionalized capabilities essential to administrative performance and productivity.

Facilitation of the private sector. Some development plans are limited almost entirely to efforts of government and the use of public resources. In socialist states, the area of action by private entrepreneurs may be very limited. Whether the private sector is large or small, a country needs to enlist the maximum amount of individual initiative and investment to contribute to development goals and processes. In the aggregate this can constitute an enormous amount of otherwise untapped energy directed into development purposes.

From a pragmatic standpoint, the more entrepreneural initiatives that can be left confidently to the market in fulfilling development objectives, the less complicated will be the administrative burdens of government. Infrastructure, activities, and enterprises which can only be implemented effectively by government in the common interest are obviously public functions. However, to the extent it is feasible to leave details of investment, production, consumption, prices, etc., to the market, the more manageable becomes the development effort. In many countries the market is a poor signal of demand and supply and fails to achieve a good allocation of resources in the total public interest. Thus, the market may require considerable governmental conditioning or stimulation.

Stated objectives and roles for the private sector are no more self-implementing than those calling for government action. Maximizing its contribution requires incentives and assistance. These include market studies, technical guidance in organizing new ventures, development loans, tax inducements, manpower training, construction of infrastructure, use of foreign exchange, aid in breaking bottlenecks, and other facilitating help. Such policies and activities should be resolved as part of the planning process.

Documenting the plan. Part of the difficulty in comprehensive planning is the attempt to have a single document serve multiple purposes. A nation's medium term development plan, for example, is many faceted. It is a political/social manifesto, a policy brief, a programme blueprint, a financial abstract, and an administrative improvement prospectus. There are different publics to be served: political parties, citizen and civic groups, legislators, government administrators, development planners and budgeteers, development assistance agencies, and other constituencies.

While there may be one general medium term plan periodically updated, different documents containing elements relevant to different constituencies or purposes are needed. This calls for reassembling the contents of a comprehensive plan into summary expositions for popular consumption; a policy/programme resumé for legislative/executive enactment; a total financial programme – current and capital – annual and long-term, covering all funds for those involved in financial measures; annexes or sub-plans delineating goals, programmes, and costs for sectors, regions, and local governments; programmes for enhancing the private sector, for manpower, for physical resources; a prospectus for a programme of administrative reform and improvement to create operational capability for implementation, etc.

A process, not a document. This emphasis on documentation should not support the persistent but fading assumption that development planning consists of the preparation of a document. Some plans are written as though the data base was static and that the country would move inexorably toward stated targets through the operation of economic forces.

This assumption is waning, with wider realization that planning is a process, entailing continuous reassessment and adjustment. Documents reflect a "reading" at a particular time. They provide a base for replanning, rescheduling, and a means of future comparative readings. Frequent updating of the data base and revision of projections and operational components is essential.

Emphasis on planning as a process facilitates implementation. It induces development planning agencies to follow through in evaluation of progress, in exercising co-ordination in execution, and in initiating correctional measures when achievement lags.

II. **Creating Administrative Capability**

What can development assistance agencies and individual countries do to reduce present operational constraints while achieving administrative leadership and management systems oriented to development?

The basic requirement is to attach as much importance to measures to create administrative capabilities for programme development and implementation at national, regional, and local levels as is devoted to formulating plans and policies based on aggregate models. Sustained political and executive commitment to administrative reform and improvement is an indispensable element in any development strategy.

Ingredients of administrative capability. If practical measures are to be taken to replace ineffective and wasteful operations with dynamic performance, greater knowledge is needed about what constitutes administrative capability and how it is created. The writings on what constitutes administrative capability and its evaluation mainly elaborate complications and the diversity of factors to be considered. Many persons seem to assume that administrative knowledge is intuitive – only a matter of common sense. This may explain why technical co-operation in public administration has had a back seat.

As in any other complex field of action, planning and implementation of systems to enhance organizational and managerial effectiveness require painstaking research and development (R & D) of an applied or action character. Few countries have established and financed research institutions devoted to the development and dissemination of administrative knowledge comparable to efforts in physical sciences and technology, agriculture, or public health. Unless a programme of R & D for continuing administrative reform is featured in the development plans of a country or otherwise placed high in the government's priorities, not much is likely to be changed.

Reduced to capsule form, capability may be said to consist of an effective combination of:

(1) Legal authority and political mandate supportive of essential administrative initiatives and reforms.

(2) Executive leadership oriented to policy and programme development and to improvement of performance.

(3) Facilitative organizational structures, administrative systems, processes, and methods.

(4) Provision for the necessary human, physical, and informational resources.

(5) Effective supervision involving employees as participating partners in planning, improving, and carrying out policies, programmes, and operations.

Consideration of the effect of existing constraints is necessary in assessing the potential contribution of each of these variables in a particular situation. For example, there must be a substantial ingredient of political leadership, societal cohesion, responsible citizen behaviour, and other supportive factors in the environment.

These factors in some suitable mix determine performance and productivity at all levels of government and in individual units. If increased capability and performance is sought, the individual factors and their mix must be improved.

It is interesting to compare the above list with the combination of institutional variables considered essential to achievement as developed by the Inter-University Research Programme in Institutional Building:[2] (1) leadership, (2) doctrine, (3) programme, (4) resources, (5) internal structure; plus supportive linkages of various kinds.

Tooling up for action. A government determined to embark on measures to achieve exceptional capability in respect of these factors must make very fundamental commitments and be prepared for heavy labours and difficult decisions. Probably more administrative reform plans than development plans end up in bookcases gathering dust. The reason is that few citizens or politicians care about administrative issues, in contrast to being highly concerned with more schools, roads, water, and jobs.

Administrative development is a continuous process. Like economic planning nothing has been changed merely by publishing a report. A government thus needs an administrative planning strategy and a recognized staff of experts attached to the office of its chief executive as a complementary unit to its development planning, programme budgeting, and personnel management staffs. All must work in concert to aid the chief executive and heads of ministries and other agencies in achieving administrative potency.

Three primary managerial instruments are vital to producing the plans, competences, and motivations to effect change throughout a governmental system. These are (1) establishment of administrative management or improvement units, centrally and in all sizeable ministries, departments, enterprises, regions, and cities, (2) assignment of responsibility to programme managers and supervisors (with appropriate staff support) for developing effective organization, administrative systems, and management, (3) pre-service and in-service training to produce persons with the needed competences and motivations. To this end schools and institutes responsible for public service training, action-research, and advisory services should be broadened or established. These three requisites require institutionalization and continuous support at all governmental levels.

A further ingredient of a successful strategy is to reinforce the traditional tasks and competences of development planning agencies. This includes: (1) designation of a lead man and supporting staff to focus on the administrative aspects of plan formulation and implementation, (2) initiation of collaborative relations with the budget staff to assure integration of annual and capital budgeting with development planning, (3) appointment of operationally oriented officers to advise with ministries, agencies, and enterprises in formulation and execution of projects and programmes, and (4) creation of units responsible for monitoring progress (performance) and for working with administrative management or improvement offices to eliminate operational bottlenecks and expedite administrative processes. These latter units require staff trained in management and systems analysis. They supplement and assist on specific problems the work of the administrative management or planning offices, both the central office and the staffs in ministries and other agencies.

---

[2] A Review of Phase I, 1964-68, Joseph W. Eaton, Research Headquarters, University of Pittsburgh.

Performance for everybody. Many governments have demonstrated capability of administering development which benefits the richest 10-20 per cent of the population, but not the 30-60 per cent of the very poor. Robert McNamara, President of the World Bank group, emphasized this in his address to the 1972 United Nations Conference on Trade and Development in Santiago, Chile: "countries which have registered significant gains in GNP growth rates are plagued with severely skewed income distribution patterns". He described what countries must do for themselves and the flow of development assistance to reduce the "crushing disparities".

Some countries have endeavoured to cope with this problem in their development plans and legislative enactments. With mounting concern for population growth, unemployment, and other social problems, the necessity of better income distribution is receiving attention. This leads to programmes such as public works utilizing labour intensive (rather than economically more efficient) methods, and new kinds of rural and urban social services.

If a government is preoccupied in its plans with overall GNP or per capita growth and is politically and administratively oriented to serving privileged elites, it is not likely to have adopted policies and programmes essential to raise the per capita income of the impoverished masses. Not only is strong and persevering leadership required to provide the political basis for change, but conditions will not be rectified without reshaping, reorienting, and energizing the entire national/regional/local administrative system. This calls for revamping administrative structures, processes, and managerial practices and a large amount of pre-service and in-service training, with both concentrated on development administration for total social benefit.

III. United Nations Initiatives

The United Nations has taken several steps to spur initiatives by member states to increase their development capabilities. One of these of a tangential character was the General Assembly Resolution of 1970 defining the International Development Strategy for the Second United Nations Development Decade (GA Resolution 2626 XXV). The most significant step was the preparation under the direction of the Secretary General of a report setting forth "Proposed Objectives and Programmes in Public Administration in the Second United Nations Development Decade".

Strategy targets. The International Development Strategy outlines some sixty-nine development goals or targets as a challenge to member states for the ten-year period. These targets focus on quantitative economic and social goals such as: growth of gross product, enrolment of children of primary school age, expansion in manufacturing output, increase in agricultural production, expansion of exports, reduction in unemployment, more adequate housing, etc.

Among the sixty-nine goals are three which relate to special aspects of administration: "strengthening and streamlining tax administration", "improvement of efficiency of public enterprise", and "strengthening of planning mechanisms". A fourth is all inclusive "strengthening of public administration". There is no delineation in the strategy as to what constitutes strengthening or improvement or what countries should do about them. The resolution disposes of these objectives by urging countries to "pay special attention to the orientation and organization of their public administration at all levels for both the effective formulation and implementation of their development plans".

Even though representatives of countries who agreed on the provisions of this resolution gave slight attention to defining administrative targets, this very fact emphasizes the need for initiatives through other channels.

Proposals of the Secretary General. Spurred by the necessity of greatly increased administrative capability among member states to implement the development targets and to comply with an Economic and Social Council resolution, the Secretary General in the fall of 1970 issued a comprehensive report entitled "Proposed Objectives and Programmes in Public Administration in the Second United Nations Development Decade".[3] Excellent staff work for this report was provided by the Public Administration Division working in consultation with other units of the United Nations and with the Specialized Agencies.

This U.N. report takes the International Development Strategy as its springboard or frame of reference. It stresses the urgency and need for bold action for the improvement of public administration in order to enable the developing countries to achieve the economic and social targets set by the General Assembly.

The report delineates the challenges, objectives, and proposed international programmes to assist countries in improving their administrations. Co-operative ventures between the U.N. and the Specialized Agencies are stressed.

The main body of the report consists of proposals for extending international assistance in seventeen administrative fields or problem areas. Among them are administrative aspects of development planning and plan implementation, major administrative reform and management improvement, personnel administration, training, financial administration, administration of sectoral functions, management of public enterprises, administration of regulatory functions, regional administration and local government, and judicial and legal administration.

Recommendations of The Meeting of Experts. In January 1971, the Secretary General convened the Second Meeting of Experts to review the proposed United Nations Programme in Public Administration. The seventeen persons comprising the group, together with staff of the U.N. and the Specialized Agencies, considered the administrative tasks entailed in fulfilling the International Development Strategy and the adequacy therefor of the proposed programmes in public administration. The group were impressed with the merit of the proposals but were disappointed by the limited resources available for their implementation in terms of personnel and funds.

---

[3] This report is published as Annex II in "Public Administration in the Second United Nations Decade, Report of the Second Meeting of Experts", United Nations Publication ST/TAO/M/57. All persons concerned with achieving development and improving governmental performance should have a copy for ready reference.

In this report, the Experts endorsed the proposed programmes with indications of priorities and special features to be stressed. They recalled "the shortfalls in the implementation of development plans in the 1960s, and agreed that far greater effort would be needed in the 1970s to increase administrative capability not only of national, but also of international institutions".

More specifically the group recommended "that measures to increase administrative capability form part of the development plans at all levels"; "that the Secretary General's proposed objectives and programmes in public administration, as reviewed by the Meeting, be approved as the basis for action by organizations in the United Nations system"; that UNDP "give sympathetic consideration to requests of governments for assistance in increasing their administrative capability for development on a government-wide basis and in individual sectors"; and that "the staff resources of the Public Administration units at headquarters and in the regions be substantially strengthened and that increased amounts of technical co-operation funds be made available for interregional and regional projects in public administration".

The group were pleased to note the closer co-operative relationships developing between the U.N. Public Administration Division and the Specialized Agencies. The members thought that by the linking of administrative experts with persons concerned with sectoral programmes a greater contribution could be made not only to the strengthening of national administrations centrally but also where it counts most, namely in the ministries, public enterprises, regions, and local jurisdictions responsible for the actual carrying out of programmes and projects. In endorsing this principle the group recommended that "all appropriate steps be taken to develop collaborative efforts in formulating and implementing sectoral projects which have a high administrative content".

Insufficient resources. The Experts were disturbed by the "miniscule" resources assigned to these collaborative efforts. Members of the group found that the U.N. Public Administration Division had been allocated only fifteen permanent headquarters posts, plus about six advisers. These slim resources must be spread over seventeen fields, each requiring much R & D and a variety of technical assistance processes. (These figures obviously do not include experts provided to countries in response to technical assistance requests).

The U.N. Public Administration Division is now engaged, insofar as its limited resources permit, in implementing the proposals of the Secretary General as amplified by the Meeting of Experts and subsequently endorsed by the Economic and Social Council.

Progress reporting. The International Development Strategy resolution provides for a biennial and mid-term review of progress. The U.N. and its Specialized Agencies are searching for quantitative indicators of progress in achieving targets for use in country reports, e.g. expansion in agricultural output, reduction in literacy, increase in savings, etc. This effort has not yet been sufficiently successful to enable the distribution of reporting schedules to member states. As an alternative, countries have been asked to send to the U.N. "their own national appraisals that they have made or will undertake in connection with the implementation of the International Development Strategy in the course of 1971 and 1972". They are also requested to provide plan documents, surveys, and other information considered helpful in interpreting the results of their national appraisals.

Initiation of a system of international reporting of national conditions and achievements encounters many difficulties. If information involves standardized units and indices which are a normal part of national statistical systems, the collection and publication of relatively comparable data is feasible.

However, for many substantive targets in the International Development Strategy quantitative measures are not in general use. For some targets, such as the four related to public administration, quantitative indicators are unavailable.

Unless standardized data has become an accepted feature of national statistical systems relatively free from tampering, it seems unrealistic to expect countries to report information for international circulation which they believe will reflect on their success in meeting U.N. targets. Consider the fate of a civil servant who fills in a questionnaire for transmission to the U.N. which indicates that the country's personnel or budget system is deficient.

One alternative is to give countries an opportunity to report the measures they have taken to improve their administrations, using a classification of fields or elements considered to have exceptional significance in creating administrative capability. Such a report, together with information on measures planned during subsequent years and kinds of technical co-operation desired, would have considerable value. It would reveal the administrative elements or problems to which countries attach priority and thus give the U.N. guidance as to the kinds of international programmes of maximum help. This type of reporting would also encourage countries to give greater attention to administrative reform and managerial improvement.

IV. Self-Assessment and Improvement

While recognizing the value of progress reporting and the publication of significant measures which countries have taken to improve their administrations, what I believe would be of most benefit is practical guidance in undertaking self-assessments of administrative capabilities and in carrying out programmes of improvement. This entails the development of handbooks containing self-assessment schedules and procedures for analyzing each major element or field which affects significantly a country's administrative capability. Each country would need to adapt the schedules and methods to fit its particular circumstances.

This kind of effort calls for much research and experimentation. Aside from some preliminary studies commissioned by the U.N. and the work of some persons engaged in major administrative reforms, little material of practical value is available. This task is a challenge to the total world public administration community.

Elements of capability. The key to developing a system for evaluation of administrative capability and progress is the selection of meaningful elements or criteria. Unfortunately no simple indicators or criteria are available. Quantitative measures of performance and productivity are only possible for very specific activities and operations. Such measures are invaluable for programme planning, budgeting, and management, and need much development.

After some experimentation, I have concluded that the most practical approach is to draw upon components or elements found advantageous in conducting comprehensive surveys and improvements of administrative systems. In the following list I have selected specific elements which contribute most to the five broad ingredients of administrative capability mentioned in Part II and which yield to assessable characteristics:

(1) Adequacy of the legal and political mandate and other supportive forces.

(2) Effectiveness of the administrative management role of the chief executive and supportive management systems.

(3) Adequacy of the system for development planning and allocation of resources.

(4) Evidence of continuous and productive administrative reform and improvement.

(5) Performance of financial institutions and processes.

(6) Successful recruitment and management of personnel.

(7) Coverage and sufficiency of administrative training and research.

(8) Effective management of individual ministries and/or departments and agencies.

(9) Efficient management of public enterprises.

(10) A positive development role for regional (states, provinces, districts) governments.

(11) Effectively organized and managed local governments.

(12) Competent and impartial regulatory and judicial administration.

(13) Facilitation of private initiative for development purposes.

The compatibility of many of these elements with the categories in the U.N. "Proposed Objectives and Programmes in Public Administration" has many advantages.

Each element standing alone would mean different things to different persons. To facilitate clarity for assessment, I have developed a brief description for each element. For example, the following describes what is meant by item 8, "Effective Management of individual ministries and/or departments and agencies".

(8) *Management of Ministries and Agencies.* The performance and productivity of the basic sectoral or operating units of government are the ultimate test of the capability of a government. This calls for evaluation of the ministries, departments, directorates, divisions, or whatever the programmatic agencies are called. Corresponding units are found in regional and local governments. The elements or factors which determine whether an operating unit has the administrative capability to produce high quantitative and qualitative results parallel to those of a government as a whole. Of special significance are: (a) the role and competence of the administrative leadership or executive management arrangements for the agency, (b) the effectiveness of the programme planning, budgeting, administrative improvement, accounting, and other managerial or facilitative processes, (c) the appointment and development of high-quality employees on a merit basis, (d) clarity of assignments, (e) provision of resources adequate to discharge responsibilities, (f) involvement of supervisors and employees at all levels and areas in participatory or consultative processes, (g) effective working relations with regional and local governments and with citizen groups and organizations, and (h) the overall test of accomplishments in planning, scheduling, organizing and implementing programmes, projects, and activities.

Application of elements. Each country, ministry, enterprise, state or province, and municipality requires its own strategy for removing constraints and achieving institutional effectiveness. The particular mix of elements or areas selected for concentrated attention will depend on local circumstances. Having selected a set of elements for analytical application, the next task is to design the schedules for making the assessments. The appendix to this article provides a suggested schedule for use by officials of ministries and other agencies to secure a general assessment of their administrative management and performance, e.g. to cover item 8 in the above list.

Obviously, the use of schedules of this type involves much subjective judgement. However, if a team of qualified analysts within or without an agency can reach a consensus on the situation, an informed assessment would be available. This should be of great value in determining whether to undertake a general or limited programme of administrative improvement in the agency and what aspects should be stressed.

Any plan for self-appraisals utilizing such schedules should also show how the information can contribute to a sustained programme to improve administrative management. Few countries focus on those key requisites outlined in Part II or follow through with the arduous tasks of implementation.

Ways to reorganize and revitalize organizations, administrative systems, and management should be distilled from worldwide experience and made available to all officials contemplating such a programme. In this way both encouragement and guidance could be provided to countries determined to upgrade their administrations.

Research and development. Effective action along these lines requires much research and experimentation. Other than a few general commentaries on appraising administrative capability, I have located little of value for operational purposes. What is needed is intensive research and development to design practical instruments and systems and the marketing of guidance material covering both evaluation and conduct of administrative improvement programmes.

R & D efforts are necessary both internationally and within individual countries. One intriguing possibility would be a co-operative effort between the U.N. Public Administration Division and the International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration, an organ of the International Institute of Administrative Sciences, with headquarters in Brussels. The U.N. could do the basic R & D, but would assign funds to selected institutions in countries desiring to participate to help in adapting the instruments and systems to local needs. Administrative reform and management organs of member states would need to be enlisted in any such effort.

The schools and institutes could contribute in several ways. Their job should be to train personnel of a country in the administrative aspects of planning and implementing development efforts and in managing programmes and services at national, regional, and local levels. More specifically, they are the centres of education and research where objective analysis and new approaches of a scientific quality should be formulated to facilitate administrative reform and improvement.[4]

In the long run the Administrative effectiveness of a government depends on whether it is developing personnel in its pre-service and in-service education and training system with the competences and commitments required to implement administrative reform and to carry forward each aspect of its development effort. Any worldwide review quickly produces a conclusion that most countries are doing very little of a comprehensive and sustained character. Most schools and centres for public service education and research are starved for funds, and most agencies resist assignment of employees to training programmes.

---

[4] See *Handbook on Organizing Schools and Institutes of Administration*, Donald C. Stone, editor, University of Pittsburgh.

APPENDIX

Schedule
For self-assessment

Schedule: EVALUATION OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGEMENT CAPABILITY OF A MINISTRY, DEPARTMENT, OR AGENCY

Title of Agency ....

Evaluator .... Date ....

Note: Check the statement that is most applicable under each item, or insert a more suitable statement under "(5) Other".

1.(a) Effective administrative management of government agencies calls for a combination of dynamic policy and programme leadership and competent managerial direction with a professional "general manager", "permanent secretary", "secretary general", or equivalent who plans, directs, mediates, and improves the work of the agency.

(1) Roles are well defined and effective in providing administrative leadership in carrying out agency's functions and improving its administrative management ....

(2) Administrative leadership arrangements well designed but frequently not effectively executed because of unskilled management actions ....

(3) Agency head and associates not much concerned with administrative management and programme operations; no significant provision for administrative leadership and internal management ....

(4) Lack of continuity in agency direction with little capacity to plan and manage programmes and projects, to mobilize resources and support, and to improve administrative management ....

(5) Other:

(b) During the past two years the following changes have occurred: Major strengthening in the role and effectiveness of administrative leadership roles .... Some improvement with discernible favourable effect on performance .... No change .... Some deterioration in agency leadership and management, resulting in loss of effectiveness .... Substantial loss of leadership effectiveness with decline in morale and performance ....

2.(a) An important feature of agency administration and accomplishment is effective programme planning, budgeting, administrative improvement, personnel, accounting, and other central staff officers and systems.

(1) Agency is well equipped with competent and effective staff units and systems ....

(2) Some staff units make a good contribution to administrative and operating effectiveness with gaps in other staff areas ....

(3) Staff units make little contribution ....

(4) Staff units are ineffective or non-existent ....

(5) Other:

(b) During the past two years: Much progress has been made in recognizing the need for and in establishing staff units and improved systems .... The quality of staff work and systems has noticeably improved .... No change .... The competence of staff units and effectiveness of managerial systems has declined .... Substantial deterioration has occurred ....

3.(a) The performance of an agency is enhanced by the appointment of heads and employees of the operating subdivisions on a merit basis, with compensation sufficient to enable full-time service, by defining responsibilities, by continuous training of supervisors and their staffs, by fostering of participation and co-operative effort, and by providing essential resources (funds, manpower, equipment, supplies, etc.).

(1) Most heads of operating units are competent, know their functions, are delegated appropriate authority, train and support their subordinates, and are highly regarded for managerial ability ....

(2) More than half of the units have a good reputation in these matters ....

(3) Considerable lack of managerial effectiveness in these matters in most operating units ....

(4) Agency is characterized by authoritarian supervision, confusion in expectations, poor mobilization of resources, and low morale ....

(5) Other:

(b) The following has happened during the past two years: A very considerable improvement in clarification of responsibilities and in managerial effectiveness in the operating subdivisions of the agency .... Some subdivisions have shown much improvement while others have lagged .... No change .... The managerial effectiveness and morale of subdivisions have declined .... Confusion, poor use of resources, and inept management have become much more prevalent ....

4.(a) The basic test of agency performance is its record in planning, programming, organizing and especially in executing successfully the agency's mission as reflected in its programmes, projects, and activities.

(1) Agency noted for high performance in preparing plans, organizing resources, meeting deadlines, and completing its work commitments productively and competently ....

(2) Good but not outstanding record in getting assignments finished ....

(3) Some good performance but most programmes and projects are not completed effectively within authorized funds ....

(4) Performance throughout agency characterized by inefficient use of resources, failure to do good work and complete it on schedule, and frequent overruns of anticipated costs ....

(5) Other:

(b) The following indicates changes in performance during the past two years: Programmes and projects are conducted more effectively and completed more nearly on schedule without many cost overruns .... Some improvement in programme and project performance .... No change .... Completion of programmes and projects encounters more difficulty and breakdowns .... Substantial deterioration of ability of agency to plan, manage, and carry out work effectively and efficiently ....

The Role of Local Government in Economic Development in Africa

By SAMUEL HUMES

Dr. Humes is Professor of Government at the Centre for African Research and Administrative Development (CAFRAD), Tangier.

LOCAL authorities have a crucial, although generally a latent, role in developing the economic potential of almost every country round the globe. Their role is important in those countries whose infrastructure, public services, and resources are relatively more developed and whose sectional loyalties have been tempered by decades and even centuries of national consciousness. Their role is far more critical in those countries of Africa as well as Asia and Latin America – the so-called developing countries – in which there are so few of the facilities which are taken for granted in the more developed countries, so few resources for developing services, and so many strident demands from every community for more amenities. The challenge and the opportunity to use institutions of local government as an essential means to economic development have long been recognized; but the striking contrast between their potential and their performance is a matter of increasing concern. In surveying the need for enhancing the development potential of local government, the practices of the past decades and the problems underlying the present ineffectiveness, it is evident that the basic weakness of local government, as a promoter of economic development, has been the lack of sufficient functions, funds and functionaries to undertake the capital development so vital to economic prosperity.

The extent of the need for economic and social development is indicated by the paucity of those amenities so essential if progress is to be achieved but which tend to be taken for granted in the so-called "developed countries". Even in one of the most developed areas of one of the most prosperous of the developing countries (the Western State of Nigeria with 30,000 square miles and almost 10 million people) there were less than 10,000 miles of road (some of which were passable only in the dry season), fewer than 75 secondary schools, 50 water supply systems, 50 post offices, 30 telephone exchanges (and 3,000 subscribers), and 25 hospitals (including the so-called "cottage hospitals") in the mid-sixties. And most of these were concentrated in the larger towns. Clearly the development of more facilities and services is essential to the promotion of prosperity and the satisfaction of rising expectations and political demands.

No institutions are potentially more important in the development of the facilities and services upon which economic prosperity depends than those of local government. As Gunnar Myrdal has pointed out "national plans and policies have actually done very little to raise the levels of living of the masses, which is the most important factor if you seek rapid and continuing development". National efforts have generally focused on major programmes such as universities, super-highways, and general hospitals rather than on projects which have a more direct and immediate impact on the daily lives of the citizens, such as primary schools, dispensaries and feeder roads. But such local efforts, with national support, are needed to continue to raise a balanced country-wide prosperity, to meet the rising expectation, and to alleviate the frustration and dissension that can and has threatened national unity. For when a local government builds a new school it often serves as a stimulus for neighbouring ones to do likewise; when the central government does so it can serve as a source of resentment that a neighbouring area was more favoured. Local government thus serves to reduce rather than accentuate sectional tensions, and to alleviate the strains on national unity. Local governments are potentially more capable of ascertaining local needs, considering community demands, determining priorities, mustering local resources, and arousing general interest and support and thus meeting many local needs more effectively and less expensively. The handicaps inherent in running the broad array of services for a wide variety of local communities directly from a distant capital are serious in any society. The difficulties are especially evident in societies with an agricultural economy, a significant degree of illiteracy, relatively inadequate transportation and communications networks, firmly-rooted ethnic and local community loyalties, a capital-concentrated bureaucracy, and a public with little support with the central government. Central governments have not the rapport and are not therefore as competent to determine local needs and allocate local resources.

The concern for the role of local government in economic and capital development is not a recent phenomenon; the relationship between local institutional and economic development has been repeatedly enunciated over the decades – by administrators, academics and politicians. During the colonial era, the French organized some communes in urban areas, which had developed as a direct result of foreign colonization and commerce. With regard to the few communes which were organized in West Africa in the 19th century, the then French Naval Minister, Vice-Admiral Pothau, wrote "they have . . . shown a real aptitude for the management of local affairs". This was an initial application of the French colonial policy of "assimilation" – which was later modified to "association" – in contrast to the British policy of "indirect rule". In the 20th century the desirability of decentralization and development was articulated by Francois Peirou and Jules Hammond.

Anglophone leaders have been more articulate in their advocacy of the local role in economic development. Sir Frederick (later Lord) Lugard (soldier and colonial administrator, unified Nigeria's first Governor-General, exponent, indeed originator, of the theory of Indirect Rule through Native Authorities) clearly set forth the need for strengthening local administration[1]. Throughout the colonial period the officials as well as the observers were conscious of the needs for development[2]. But then as now there were complaints that there was not enough money nor men with sufficient experience and expertise to practise what was being professed. One of the most succinct statements on the inter-dependence of developing local institutions and services was made by Mr. Creech Jones, then British Secretary of State for the Colonies, on 25th February, 1947; he said:

---

[1] In his Political Memoranda (1918) and book *The Dual Mandate in British Tropical Africa*, Cass, London (1922).

[2] As the colonial reports and Margery Perham's *Native Administration in Nigeria*, Oxford, (1932) indicate.

"Since I took office in October, I have been considering some of the basic problems of African administration . . . since our success in handling these problems, and the extent to which we can secure the active co-operation of the Africans themselves, may well determine the measure of our achievement in the programmes of political, social and economic advancement on which we have now embarked. I believe that the key to success lies in the development of an efficient and democratic system of local government. I wish to emphasize the words efficient, democratic and local. I do so, not because they import any new conception into African administration; indeed these have been the aims of our policy over many years. I use these words because they seem to me to contain the kernel of the whole matter: *local* because the system of government must be close to the common people and their problems; *efficient* because it must be capable of managing the local services in a way which will help to raise the standard of living; and *democratic* because it must not only find a place for the growing class of educated men, but at the same time command the respect and support of the mass of the people."

A few years later (1952) upon introducing a bill to reorganize local governments, one of the political leaders of an African country (Chief Awolowo who was a former Western Nigerian Premier and a Vice-Chairman of the Nigerian Federal Cabinet, under General Gowan, until his resignation in 1971) said that local government "is the most effective agency by means of which . . . Government ministers to the basic needs, welfare and general well-being of the citizens". The advent of independence for a host of African countries in the post-war years accentuated and accelerated the concern for development and for change in the institutions responsible for development.

The number, the pervasive nature, and the rationale of many of the reforms of local governments in the so-called developing countries indicate the importance which was attached to the extension of local democracy and development. Ursula Hicks[3], Henry Maddick[4] and The International Union of Local Authorities, based at The Hague[5], were among those who have indicated the need for a partnership between central and local institutions in developing economic prosperity and public participation.

Unfortunately, the experience of the sixties with regard to the role of local government in economic development has fallen far short of the expectations of the fifties. The most conspicuous manifestation of the failure has been the poor record in capital development – the building of new schools, roads, dispensaries and other local facilities. Interrelated deficiencies in planning, programming and budgeting have undermined any sustained effort in long-term public policy development, implementation and co-ordination. Along with the national governments, the local authorities share responsibility for these shortcomings.

---

[3] In her book *Development from Below*, Oxford (1961).

[4] In his book *Democracy, Decentralization and Development*, Asia Publishing House, Bombay (1963).

[5] In its publication *The Structure of Local Government* published in 1961 and the successor book published in 1969.

To say that in most developing countries the role of local government in the planning process has been negligible is misleading; it is more accurate to say that with rare exceptions there has been no discernible local governmental process for anticipating needs and preparing plans for future development. With few exceptions local governments have been too involved in their daily problems of administrative routine to consider long-term policy objectives for developing the amenities and economic potential of their communities. They have not been involved in the preparation of the national plans, which have been the focus of so much discussion and often disillusion; even the existence of local government has sometimes been ignored in these documents. Relatively few local government bodies have been expected to prepare their own development plans – those of Northern Nigeria have been among the few exceptions. Usually such planning as has taken place in respect of local services, has generally been carried out on an *ad hoc* piecemeal basis by the field agencies of central ministries. Such efforts have hardly met the needs which a comprehensive continuous long-term process would identify, anticipate, and relate, and eventually alleviate.

The efforts to develop and implement programmes have generally been frustrated by the limitations affecting the scope and scale of local efforts. The scope of local government functions in Africa, Asia and Latin America has never been particularly wide. In many rural areas there have been few, if any, discernible government activities other than tax collection. And in many of those countries where local authorities have had a significant range of functions, such as Kenya and Nigeria, the scope has narrowed considerably in the past decade as the central agencies have taken over the direct administration of such important activities as education. The scale of activities has been constrained not only by the lack of money, but also by the lack of manpower with sufficient expertise and experience.

In anglophone countries the local budget has tended to be a compendium of estimates rather than a comprehensive means of developing policy and co-ordinating administration; generally, it has been a compilation rather than an integration of the departmental estimates whose consideration at the local level is more affected by parochial pressures than by overall policy judgement – since the structure provides many opportunities for the former and few for the latter. Since few grants have been available (and those that are may be delayed) and loans are difficult (if not impossible) to secure, the possibility of capital programmes being included in the budget has been marginal – and the probability that they will be implemented has been minimal. The generally arbitrary and tardy manner in which the budget has been reviewed, modified, and finally approved by provincial, regional and central ministry officials has impeded its usefulness as an instrument of policy. The extent to which the actual revenue and expenditure have deviated from the approved estimates has indicated the weakness of the budget development and implementation process.

In francophone countries some of these deficiencies have been overcome, for a central government official plays a major role in the initial preparation of the budget. But such a course of action hardly appears to commend itself to those interested in developing representative as well as responsible local institutions.

The cumulative result of these planning-programming-budgeting deficiencies is that little is spent on capital development – and thus too little is done to promote country-wide economic prosperity. The total expenditure of all local authorities' treasuries in most African, Asian and Latin American countries has been little enough; what is spent for the development of new local facilities has been least of all – especially when compared with the obvious needs. Generally the only local authorities with any significant capital investment have been those in urban areas in which the needs are so obviously urgent (and where the central bureaucracy is located). Overall, the investment in the cities has been quite inadequate compared with the increased needs for health, education, transportation, security and other services which have arisen as the result of rapid growth and increased congestion. But it has been sufficient to continue to attract people from the rural areas which have been even more neglected.

One cannot blame the lack of capital investment wholly on the prevailing poverty of an area. Within a particular country one area may have a demonsstrably better record than another – even though its per capita income level is lower. For example, most of the native authorities of Northern Nigeria (where local development plans have been mandatory) have spent on the average about 10 times as much per person per year as those in Western Nigeria – despite the fact that their income per capita in the West is generally recognized to be at least 50 per cent higher than in the North.

The weaknesses in the planning-programming-budgeting process, which is basic to economic development, are a symptom of the general malaise affecting local government. These shortcomings may be identified as patronisation, petty-sized jurisdiction, poor policy leadership, paucity of professional and administrative expertise, poverty, powerlessness and parochialism. The basic one may be the patronizing attitude of central government, a colonial practice which is even more evident in present day central-local relations; the ministries with responsibilities for local government have not been noticeably successful in promoting the development of local institutions or even in defending their functions and revenue sources – for while some of the colonial governments at least appeared to recognize local government as a necessary branch of the state system, many present governments appear to consider local units as only marginally useful. The petty size of their jurisdiction prevents them from handling responsibilities which are sufficiently significant to win the interest and support of the local citizens. The poor quality of local political leadership is manifested in the peripheral role of the elected councils, the calibre of the councillors and the inadequate recognition of the concept of a political chief executive. A significant shortcoming has been the lack of qualified professional and top management leadership. The general poverty of local government has inhibited the development of facilities and even the continuance of programmes. The scope and scale of services provided have never been sufficient for the needs; in many countries its functional role has been reduced by the transfer of key local services to the central government – thus also reducing the local government role as a stimulator of public programmes and alleviator of increasing demands and incipient dissatisfaction. And parochial pressures and pride, frequently described as "tribalism", have diverted funds and support energies instead of providing a stimulus to local developments.

At least some of these problems pester local government bodies in all countries. They plague local government in most of Africa, Asia and Latin America. They serve as a pretext for local governments not performing better. And the inability of local government to overcome these problems serves as an excuse for the lack of enthusiasm for local institutions and the continuing trend toward centralization. In many countries central government field agencies are the only agencies with a developmental function; the principal role of local authorities, with their limited money and expertise, appears to be to secure local participation for government schemes and to represent local interests to the government. This trend is supported by the contention that there are not enough competent people nor sufficient funds to do everything that needs to be done, that tribal and sectional loyalties must be broken down and the first priority must be nation-building and national unity. The consequent lack of attention to local government has meant local involvement and community development have been costly in terms of local participation in the long range economic development of the country and has provided a constraint on countrywide understanding and support for the national government.

Local authorities have a two-fold responsibility in enhancing their role in the economic development process. One is to press for a new approach to central-local relations, recognizing the roles as complementary rather than competitive. The second is to establish and strengthen the process for planning services, programming activities, budgeting funds, and co-ordinating the policy of development and management. One suggestion for concerting both approaches is to focus the general administrative responsibility for local and central efforts at the local level on one official – one who would serve not only as the chief executive of the local government but also as the official of the central government responsible for co-ordinating the field services of the various ministries. Such an official would combine the role of the prefect/divisional officer and the local government secretary/secretary-general*.

A concerted approach is vital. For local authorities cannot expect central officials to be sympathetic to their legitimate claims for an improved mandate, more money and better qualified men, unless they demonstrate their ability to develop and use wisely the resources they already have. But also local government can never aspire to a significant role in economic development without the necessary resources and expertise, and thus cannot be secured without the support of central government. How this issue is met will affect the political stability and unity of the countries as well as their general economic prosperity.

---

* *There are some instances where this has taken place, to a lesser or greater degree.*—Ed.

The phrase "developing country" indicates the need to develop the public facilities and services of many African as well as Asian and Latin American countries, which is reflected in the accent on "development administration" and "community development". But just as public administration has often appeared to be primarily concerned with the techniques of administration, so development administration sometimes has appeared to be primarily concerned with the conditions affecting administration; and community development has frequently appeared to be primarily concerned with the process of involving people. The interdependent need for developing local institutions has been too easily overlooked. What is needed is a renewed concern for developing representative and responsible institutions of government at the local level which can manage the development and administration of those facilities and services and muster the local resources and support which are necessary for the promotion of economic prosperity.

Local Government Reform in the Sudan

By JOHN HOWELL

Mr. Howell is Lecturer in Political Science at the University of Khartoum.

SINCE the return to power of Major-General Gaafar al-Numeiri in the Sudan, following the three-day *coup* of left-wing officers in July 1971, a number of long-promised institutional reforms and innovations have begun to take shape. In September 1971, following a nation-wide plebiscite, Numeiri was sworn in as President, thus ending the period of Revolutionary Command Council rule. In his restructured Government, the new President grouped Sudan's ministries, some of them distinctly lightweight, into six "functions" of Sovereignty, Service, Economy, Agriculture, Guidance, and finally Ministries of State. Among new Ministries, one for Public Service and Administrative Reform was created.

In another burst of activity towards the end of the year, a National Congress of the new Sudanese Socialist Union was convened, which, in the space of a week in January 1972, approved a National Charter, a constitution for the S.S.U., and guidelines for a new National Constitution, which included the creation of an elected People's Council which would finally draft the constitution. In other areas of reform, the Ministry of Co-operation and Rural Development (making use of the much larger Ministry of Local Government) has set up Village Development Committees designed to instil ideas of self-help and co-operative organization into Sudan's traditional rural society. The Ministry of Youth (with the help of Army drill-sergeants) has organized May Squads (*Kataeb Mayo*) in which young people in particular can develop a sense of discipline and service, and thereby, it is believed, promote the ideals of the May Revolution of 1969.

But perhaps the most far-reaching changes in the government and politics of the Sudan are likely to come with the implementation of the 1971 People's Local Government Act. It involves, firstly, a large measure of devolution of administrative authority away from the capital, Khartoum, to the nine provinces of Darfur, Kordofan, Northern, Blue Nile, Kassala, Khartoum, Equatoria, Bahr al-Ghazal and Upper Nile; and secondly, a major infusion of local popular participation into the administration of the Sudan. Both ideas seem to presuppose that the Sudan is becoming, however gradually, a reformist and democratically-minded political society and that local government should be reorganized to meet and encourage these new political aspirations.

It may be a false assumption in fact. The previous local government system, now much maligned as corrupt, undemocratic and inefficient, demonstrated the strong influence of traditionally powerful local families and sectarian political parties[1]. However, it is debatable whether it was the previous system (based on the 1948 Marshall Report) which was at fault, or the structure of society in which it operated.

In the new system, old "Native Administration elements"[2] were originally excluded (according to Ministry instructions), together with anyone identified with the less reputable aspects of previous party politics. This latter group is prohibited from participation in any part of local or national politics and is covered by a "Political Isolation" Act, which has yet to be put to legal test. In practice, of course, it is virtually impossible to exclude the traditional political forces in the Sudan. Even in parliamentary elections in the past, a powerful local family arranged comfortable election victories; it is very simple for such forces to arrange the new Village Council elections in particular, and in some cases, to exert significant influence on the higher councils also. The Ministry of Local Government has shown a commendable pragmatism in this respect (and in its later instructions), and there are many instances where the expertise and stature of the old councillors have been recognized and *Nazirs*, *Omdas*, and local party patrons have re-emerged as important figures in the new "People's Councils"[3]. However, by deliberately supporting "popular organizations", the Government hope that the new Act will gradually undermine the existing and powerful local conservatism, and eventually create a system of local politics largely immune to the massive influence of inherited status and wealth.

The new system, at its simplest, is a pyramid of People's Province Councils, People's District Councils and People's Rural and Town Councils. Below the Rural Councils are Village Councils, which were the first councils to be elected. In defining the area of the new Village Councils (with populations of around 1,000 considered desirable), the concept of "village" has become flexible, with so many rural Sudanese leading either a nomadic life or living in scattered homesteads. The Councils are composed of around 20 elected members, with a few local government officials added. Of the elected members, according to Ministry instructions, there should be 25 per cent women (which has proved practically impossible in some areas); and members of Development Committees, co-operatives (where they exist), and May Squads, are guaranteed representation.

---

[1] For almost three years after independence in 1956, and then between 1965 and 1969, the Sudan experienced Parliamentary government, in which the Umma Party (with *Ansar* sectarian support) and the National Unionist and People's Democratic Parties (both with various degrees of *Khatmia* sectarian support) played a dominant role. Even the conservative military regime of General Abboud (1958-64) often illustrated *Ansar* and *Khatmia* influence and rivalry.

[2] The formal "liquidation" of Native Administration was one of the first acts of the May Revolution of 1969. The final death sentence has still to be carried out however; most notably in the three Southern provinces where chiefs' courts remain a vital administrative prop.

[3] With the help of University of Khartoum Political Science students, the writer is currently preparing a Report on Local Government Councillors in 14 councils in the Northern Sudan. The field reports contain information on the social structure of each council, the pattern of "established authority", and data on the pre-1969 councillors as well as on the new councillors.

The next stage is the Rural Councils. These have been formed from elected representatives from the Village Councils, with officials representing various local departments, such as health, works, animal resources. Again, 25 per cent of the elected members should be women and the "popular organizations" fully represented, as in Village Councils. Instructions for the formation of these councils have not been as rigid as was once feared, although the Act itself states that the Province Council should ensure the representation of the "Revolutionary Coalition" of workers, peasants, People's Armed Forces, nationalist capitalists and nationalist intelligentsia.

In the old two-tier system of Province and Town or Rural Council, many of the Rural Council boundaries followed tribal affiliations. These have now been broken up by a large number of new councils, which in theory follow criteria of economic geography. The major aim is to bring people closer to administration, but the Government is clearly hoping that simultaneously in the new smaller councils it can begin to undermine existing tribal and traditionalist loyalties. While it may be too early to judge the Rural Councils, the functioning of the Village Councils already indicates that the Government's attachment to grass-roots participation may come under strain. For many of the new councillors, "participation" involves, above all, the opportunity to make demands on the Government, as well as on the higher councils. These demands, often for wells, schools, clinics, even hospitals, are not only very difficult to meet, but are also potentially embarrassing to a Government which claims to set so much store by the improvement of rural life.

It is in the urban areas, below the Town Councils, that the most experimental changes are taking place. Every town is divided into "Neighbourhoods", and like the Village Councils, around 20 members are elected from each. The 25 per cent women's ratio has been easier to arrange, and in the elections there has been fairly lively competition. In the town's market areas, separate councils have been elected for each business group (general merchants, tailors, butchers, etc.), and from these councils joint market councils have been formed, which may eventually have powers delegated to them directly from the Province Council. It is an experiment worth watching for political as well as administrative reasons. The merchants in the Sudan have always been closely involved in party politics, and are not the natural allies of President Numeiri's professedly-socialist government. But, the Government, in its three and a half years in office, has come to appreciate the importance of the merchants to the economic health of the land, and henceforth they are more likely to be courted than harassed.

The market and neighbourhood councils elect representatives to the Town Council. Joining them are representatives of the Revolutionary Coalition, and where there are factories, the industrial area has its own council, with representatives on the Town Council. Officials also sit on the Council but, as in the Rural Councils, the chairman is elected from among the representatives of the directly-elected members in the lower councils.

At this point the Town and Rural Councils come together in a new tier of administration, the District Council. The representatives of the Rural and Town Councils (their exact number and ratio have yet to be decided and will vary from province to province) will be joined by officials and Revolutionary Coalition members. With the new Town and Rural Councils, the District Councils bring the total number of new councils up to around 500, from 86 in the old system. By far the biggest increases in councils come in northern provinces where many new Town Councils have been created and where many of the old Rural Councils have been divided in three or four. In the southern provinces, the changes have not been radical. In Equatoria, for example, only one new Town Council has been created (Kapoeta) and five new Rural Councils. With the return of orderly and widespread administration to the three southern provinces, however, the number of councils is likely to be increased in time.

When all the stages have been completed, the People's Province Executive Council will be formed. Representatives of Town and Rural Councils will be in the majority, but the ubiquitous Revolutionary Coalition will also be represented along with representatives of Women's Organizations and Heads of Departments. The chairman will be the Provincial Commissioner, who, along with his Deputy, the Executive Director, will form a small committee to assist him in day-to-day decisions. The Province Council will administer virtually all the services in the province, including agriculture, health, education up to Senior Secondary level, roads, animal resources, housing, town planning, community development, and "law and order". Control over security is one of the most important, and possibly controversial, acquisitions of the province administration, with the Police Commandant now becoming directly responsible (formally at least), not to the Commissioner of Police in the Ministry of Interior in Khartoum, but to the local Province commissioner and People's Province Council.

As well as its dominant administrative function, the Province Council also has the political function of promoting and explaining the politics and objectives of the central Government. In this political capacity, it also has the power to exclude from local government councils anyone formerly involved in politics whose past conduct disqualifies him, in the view of the Council, from public service.

The Province Commissioner is, of course, a political figure as well as an administrative head, and the appointment of the Commissioner, by the President himself, is clearly a crucial decision for the good administration of the province, for the political reputation of the Government, and for the future of the People's Local Government Act.

The Commissioner is responsible, for the administration of the province, to the President in Khartoum, through the Minister of Local Government. His powers are, in fact, not unlike those of the old-style Governors of the Anglo-Egyptian Sudan[4] (although his province councillors are expected to have a much greater authority than their colonial counterparts). He represents the Government in the province, supervises and co-ordinates all the government departments working under the authority of the Province Council, and has the power to discipline all those civil servants working in those departments, who are, in fact, considered to be on "secondment" to the province administration. The idea of temporary secondment, in effect to the Ministry of Local Government, is not likely to recommend itself to the other central ministries, but in the context of budgetary reorganization (see below), it is, at least, "rational"; and in the more remote and backward provinces, quite sensible and practical.

---

[4] And, extending the analogy, the powers of the Minister of Local Government are not unlike those of the old Civil Secretary.

The Commissioner may also refuse to execute any decision taken by the Province Council, but he must report his decision to the Council of Ministers, through the Minister of Local Government, and if the Province Council decision is not repealed by the Council of Ministers, it becomes final. The post of Province Commissioner under the old system, filled by a career administrator from Local Government service, has become that of "Executive Director" of the province and Deputy Commissioner. New "Assistant Commissioners" will become the heads of the District Councils, with Executive Officers (the legatees of the colonial D.Cs) remaining at Town and Rural Council levels. To facilitate the assumption of authority of the *parvenu* Commissioners, who are entrusted with establishing People's Local Government, the Minister has found it expedient to reshuffle some of his old Province Commissioners, so that many of the new Commissioners find themselves working with career civil servants who, at Executive Director and Assistant Commissioner levels especially, are either newly-promoted or recently-transferred.

Another main feature of the new system concerns the Province as a budgetary unit. Previously, the budgetary unit was the local council, with the province councils having a separate budget. In addition, the different departments within the province came under their separate ministry budgets. Under the new system, the Province Council becomes the single budgetary unit. It may of course devote certain budgetary powers to councils at lower levels, but the Council will retain overall responsibility not only for the budgets of the various councils, but also for all government departments coming under its authority. As a corollary to this, revenue previously due to local councils will now go to the Province Council. Thus the new Councils concentrate financial authority by taking from above (the central ministries) and from below (the local councils). The Ministry of Treasury has, in fact, already indicated that it expects the Ministry of Local Government to take around 50 per cent of future national budgets.

It all represents a major shift in authority away from Khartoum and into the province headquarters. It is not clear as yet, however, how much power will be devolved within the province itself. But the degree of devolution will vary from province to province, with greater budgetary authority given to lower councils in the more developed and urbanised provinces.

In practice, however, it is going to be administratively difficult, in any province, to wrest powers away from those local councils which at present wield considerable authority, and it is going to be even more difficult to impose provincial authority on the various government departments which, until now, have derived their powers and budget from their central ministries. Some of the stronger departments may come to regard the Province Council as simply an inconvenient post-box to their ministry in Khartoum. Bureaucratic conservatism is strongly entrenched in the Sudan, and administrative procedure, once mastered, is not lightly altered. Thus the authority of the Province Council is bound to depend to a large extent on the will of the Commissioner himself, and how far his authority is accepted by the different councils and departments which had been used to a large degree of autonomy within the province. It will also depend on the enthusiasm of the Province Council members, and how they interpret their role. But in the Sudan, there is a strong tradition of reliance on the bureaucracy, and it is unlikely that elected and nominated members will immediately thrust themselves into the forefront of provincial administration.

Despite the Act's obvious recognition that in a country as vast as the Sudan, there should be a large-scale administrative decentralization away from Khartoum, still there are bound to be fears that the province administrations themselves will become over-centralized. Most of Sudan's provinces are roughly the size of England; by now[5], only Khartoum Province is likely to have less than one million people, with both Blue Nile and Kordofan Provinces well over two million. With provinces this size, neither administrative efficiency nor effective popular control will be easily achieved. Plans to increase the number of provinces from nine to thirteen have been shelved for the moment, although the possibility of a further layer of sub-provinces is receiving consideration at the Ministry.

One indication of the reluctance to devolve significant powers to the Rural and Town Councils is the Minister of Local Government's instruction that the new councils should not involve the Government in any increased financial burden. As the number of councils in the Sudan is being increased from 86 to around 500 (excluding the village, neighbourhood, trade, and industrial councils), this seems, on the face of it, an impossible request. For a start, many new council offices will have to be found. If the old rambling rural councils are divided into three, say, the "great reform" is going to lack credibility if all three new councils continue to share the same premises. Staffing the new councils is also likely to prove difficult. But here the Minister may claim that too many officials are at present underworked and desk-bound, and must recognize that local government service involves long hours and frequent travel. (As a former D.C. himself, the present Minister, Dr. Gaafar Mohamed Ali Bakheit, has an exemplary record in this respect). He would also argue that there is room for much greater involvement of elected and nominated members in local administration.

Financial stringency makes it evident, however, that there cannot be, at present, any large-scale devolution of power to local communities. Many of the Village Councils in the remote areas will continue for some time to sit and deliberate under the trees according to custom, with only occasional visits from the local executive officer to receive their complaints and suggestions. The neighbourhood councils' urban equivalent may be the local school-hall, with perhaps only marginally better attendance from overworked council officials.

---

[5] The last census was held in 1956. Another is due in 1973.

The larger Town Councils are likely to have considerable power, however, especially where the town has an important market or industrial area. But the District Councils will need the special concern of the Minister and Commissioners if they are not to become lost between the Province Council and powerful councils lower down with strong and well-established local interests. Especially where a large Town Council, or a single prosperous Rural Council, is included in the area of the District Council, it will be difficult for the District Council to balance the different interests of local councils, and in the process, its own authority and identity may not be easy to establish.

But by far the biggest question mark about local government reform in the Sudan concerns popular participation. With local authorities able to exclude the politically undesirable from elections, and with a determined policy to include nominated representatives of amorphous groups such as "workers", "peasants" and "intellectuals", there must be some concern that local government will become simply window-dressing for an authoritarian, manipulative and centralized government machinery. New and inexperienced councillors are also likely to be dominated by government officials within the councils, and the Minister has called upon the local government officers to adopt a committed, activist role in support of the regime. Officers have been instructed, for example, to help in the formation of the youth *Kataeb* and women's organizations and in the establishment of the Basic Units of the S.S.U.

This is less radical a departure than it appears however. In the public mind, especially in the rural areas, the local government officer has always been seen as an authoritarian agent of government policy. And, on the part of the officers, the burdens of revolutionary activism will not be easily assumed. Still overwhelmingly a graduate entry, the local government profession in the Sudan retains a phlegmatic and sceptical character which is unlikely to be reformed in a short time.

Thus, for the infusion of local democracy (be it genuine or manipulated), rather more will depend on the role that the new Sudanese Socialist Union will play, in national politics as well as in local government, and, of course, on the willingness of its members to involve themselves in problems of day-to-day administration[6]. Much will also depend on the relationship between the S.S.U. and the Government, on the degree of its administrative and financial dependence, on the method of choosing the Union's leaders, and so on.

It would be both wrong and unfair to be too sceptical towards the intentions of the Sudan Government, however. Certainly, the reform of local government is part of the Government's strategy of broadening its base of political support. But, at the same time, there is a genuine, and well-based, fear that completely open local government elections would provide the old political parties with a fifth column which could severely hinder the Government's work at provincial and local levels. And there is a genuine, populist desire to break what is considered to be the conservative stranglehold of traditionally powerful families. The contribution that many of the "workers" or "peasants" can bring to local government discussions may not be very valuable at present, and it would be a surprise if more than a small minority of women felt able to play an active role in council work. But an important first step is about to be made, and however faltering and ineffectual it may appear, there is a fair chance that in time, Local Government Reform will appear to be a major achievement of President Numeiri's Sudanese Government.

---

[6] According to its constitution, the S.S.U. "shall urge and help members to join institutions, councils and bodies that exercise political, economic and social activities, and within these spheres, ensure the general policies and political lines of the Socialist Union".

Epilogue

In March 1971, an agreement was reached between the Sudan Government and the *Anya Nya* southern insurgents to end the rebellion in the Southern provinces which in one form or another had continued throughout the period of Sudan's independence. There were important proposals concerning the recruitment and composition of the Sudan Army Southern Command and the absorption of the *Anya Nya* into government service. And initial attention has been focused on the work of the President and Members of the Interim Regional High Executive Council which now exercises major responsibility prior to elections to a Regional Assembly, possibly towards the end of 1973.

The Agreement represents a radical departure, with ramifications that few would care to predict; but for anyone familiar with the aims of the 1971 People's Local Government Act, the Southern Provinces Regional Act (1972) (which is the heart of the new *rapprochement*) appears less dramatic because, in effect, the new Act is putting a new and powerful tier between the three Southern provinces and the centre, and thus taking decentralization of authority a stage further.

In the process this has deprived both the central Ministry of Local Government, and the Province Councils themselves, of much of their former (projected) authority. The Province Commissioners have now become responsible, not to the Minister, but to the President of the H.E.C. *through* the Regional Minister for Administration. This Minister holds one of the eleven portfolios allocated to members of the H.E.C. and he has responsibility for police and prisons as well as local and regional administration. Clearly, it is a very important post, and one which deprives the Province Commissioners of much of their authority. But in addition, other H.E.C. Ministers hold portfolios for matters such as Education, Health and Animal Resources, and they have assumed charge of budget submissions for the Region as a whole, thus supervising and controlling the work of their "department" in the individual provinces. This of course further deprives the Province Commissioner, and Province Councils, of their newly-acquired powers.

Thus the budget for the Southern region is now the responsibility of the H.E.C., which co-ordinates the separate province budgets. However, the sources of local revenue from the region (one of the poorest parts of the entire continent) will obviously remain limited for some time yet. The large part of the regional budget must come, therefore, from the national treasury under the control of the Council of Ministers in Khartoum. The main item of spending is for "Established Services" (with Education and Health the biggest), and for Development Projects under the National Development Plan approved in Khartoum. Public Audit remains the responsibility of the central government. The sources of regional revenue may in time however prove fairly substantial. Revenue from cash crops such as sugar, and also from potential export-earners such as tea and coffee, will go to the region. The H.E.C. can impose regional taxes on incomes, trade and industrial products, which will be in addition to taxes imposed by the local government councils.

Another agreement is that where the H.E.C., from its own regional revenue, is able to start a project, the central government is obliged to provide a percentage of the necessary funds: for example, 30 per cent of any tourist project, 20 per cent of any education project, 15 per cent security, 20 per cent health, 25 per cent higher education and so on.

While the H.E.C. (under the new Act) "regulates the machinery of local government", it would appear that the H.E.C. and the Regional Assembly will not have the power to change the basic structure of local government if they so wished. The boundaries of councils could be changed, and the creation of new local councils will be encouraged by the central Ministry of Local Government. But any major structural reform, if sought, would have to be within the "general policies of the national government" and within the framework of the national constitution that will in time be passed by the national People's Assembly.

Of course, with pressing problems of resettlement and of the most rudimentary economic development, it is unlikely that the Regional Government will have time to apply itself to the question of local government reform. But with strong regional authority in Juba, the relevance of the present provincial authority must, sooner or later, be brought into question. Administratively, three large provinces, each with a centralized bureaucracy, do not appear to offer a solution to the widespread backwardness of the South. Politically, the provinces serve as a focus of loyalty which is often as irrational as it is divisive. And socially, the present province structure is bound to accelerate the movement towards the three big towns where authority and influence reside.

The Use of "In Basket" Exercises and Similar Techniques for Teaching Public Administration

By HUBERT ALLEN

Mr. Allen is now engaged on a Public Administration training assignment in the Dominican Republic. Until recently he was a lecturer at the Institute of Local Government Studies in Birmingham University and was seconded to the Institute of Administration at Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria from 1967 to 1970.

DURING three years recently spent in the Department of Local Government at Zaria's Institute of Administration one of my responsibilities was to explain to in-service students of local authorities and to undergraduates in the Department of Public Administration the rationale of routine office procedures and techniques of civil service management. Now, as Murray and Humes remark, "inevitably given the present balance of writing on the subject . . . the impression is difficult to avoid that public administration as a subject is to do with something a little removed from the actual . . ."[1]. In an attempt to enliven our discussions, therefore, and to prevent them becoming unduly abstract or remote I was attracted by simulation techniques which would call upon the students to apply their intelligence and to make their own decisions in more or less realistic situations. Case studies such as those described by Mr. Chadwick a few years ago[2] often proved their worth, but this article reflects on the value of another type of exercise, deriving from "In-Basket" exercises prepared by Claude Woltz in Dar-es-Salaam[3].

On two occasions I sought to use such techniques under examination conditions. At Annex 1 will be found a question set for the "Workshop in Public Administration" – one of five courses taken by final year candidates for Ahmadu Bello University's Degree of B.A. (Administration); and at Annex 2 is a question set for the final examination for the Institute's Advanced Certificate in Local Government[4] – a 9-month up-grading course for local authority staff, usually men with several years' in-service experience. Both questions were compulsory, not optional.

The students' handling of these questions illuminated most effectively their capacity to assess priorities and to react under pressure. It was therefore, in my view, very valuable in assessing the worth of the in-service students. I am less satisfied, however, that the experiment justified itself as regards the undergraduates. Degree candidates are already under great strain during their final examinations, and the added tension of such a "crisis situation" as that built up in Annex 1 caused at least one good student to "blow up" and to produce work of an uncharacteristically weak standard. Outside the examination room, however, both questions have proved their worth as teaching aids, the former for State administrative officers, the latter for local authority accounting staff.

---

[1] *Journal of Administration Overseas*: Vol X, No. 1, January 1971: D. J. Murray and S. H. Humes—"Case Study—Its Application and Development in Nigeria", p. 10.

[2] Ibid, Vol IV, No. 4, October 1965: C. M. Chadwick—"Decision-making Case Studies in Administrative Training".

[3] Claude C. Woltz (Lecturer in Public Administration): "*In-Basket*" *Exercises for Training in Public Administration—Vol. I.* (Inst. of Public Admin., University College, Dar-es-Salaam, 1966).

[4] This question, see Annex 2, was illuminating in other ways, too. "I would deal with the Emir's message first", commented one student with dry realism: "it is not really urgent, but Emirs are not at all reasonable . . ."

I have also several times – in Uganda as well as in Nigeria – made use of more elaborate "In-Tray" exercises[5]. For all of them the same general pattern was adopted. Each student was first given a "background paper", if possible at least a day in advance of the exercise. This identified his imaginary role, for the purposes of the exercise, and described the essential characteristics of the place and the people working there, with the help of a map of the imaginary local authority area (usually "Tanadi Emirate" but "Ugacity" was concocted for Uganda's Town Clerks). Next, the immediate situation was explained: in each case the officer was imagined to have been away from his office for several days – either sick or attending a conference or training course. On his return he had decided to come back to his office after working hours to dispose of as much as possible of the material that had accumulated in his "in-tray" during his absence. In each case he was assumed to be alone in the office, but for a messenger with a bicycle; both the telephone and the officer's own transport were temporarily out of order. He was required to go through all the papers in his "in-tray" and to deal with them as best he could during the two hours available. He could take any appropriate action (or no action), but it was stipulated that his treatment of every item should be recorded in writing, either on the item itself or on paper pinned to it. The use of officially recognized abbreviations[6] was encouraged. After two hours each student's papers were assembled in a separate file cover and taken by me for assessment. A few days later the papers were returned to the students in review sessions lasting two to three hours.

Each "in-tray" contained from 16 to 20 items. These were arranged in a more or less random order, save that in each case one of the items nearest the bottom of the pile was in fact the most urgent of all, so that any participant who methodically worked his way through the items one by one, completing action on each one before going on to the next, found himself confronted by crisis when most of his two hours had already elapsed. In each case, moreover, the urgent item acquired urgency only because of one of the earlier items: any participant who dealt with each matter in isolation was liable to overlook the seriousness of the situation revealed when two or more items were taken together. Thus a message reporting a broken bridge acquired more than routine urgency only when taken together with the information that the Military Governor would be travelling along that very road next morning on his way to the opening ceremony at a new secondary school. Similarly, a copy of a letter from the Co-operatives Officer to the Works Supervisor, asking for chairs to be provided from the Council Chamber for an important meeting with a U.N. Adviser, became an urgent problem only when it was noticed that agenda had been circulated calling a Council Meeting for that same date and time.

---

[5] The customary British phrase "in-tray" was used in preference to the American "in-basket": Annex 3 illustrates one of these exercises.

[6] E.g., "BU 29/7" = "Bring up again on 29th July"; or "To CDA f.n.a." = "Pass to Community Development Assistant for necessary action."

Perhaps the first important lessons learned from the exercises, then, were the need to assess *priorities* before commencing action on *any* of the papers – distinguishing, moreover, priorities of urgency and priorities of importance: minor matters might require immediate attention, whereas very important decisions were often more sensibly left to be considered at leisure. And, whilst they were quickly assessing these priorities, the participants also came to realise that they must always be alert to possible *interconnections*: matters should not be treated in isolation and dismissed from the memory as soon as dealt with.

Another lesson forcibly brought home to the participants was the importance of caution in handling matters with legal or financial implications. In each participant's "in-tray", for instance, there was a letter from a consular attaché asking for a character reference for a man who had some years previously worked as a clerk for the participant's local authority: in each case the participant had earlier minuted to his chief clerk asking "Do you remember this man?" and the clerk had now replied "No, Sir: I was not here then, but I think he was dismissed for excessive drunkenness". The participants were shown that a reply to the consulate relying on this vague report would run the risk of a libel action; so that authoritative sources of information – the man's personal files or senior officials who knew him – *must* be consulted before any definitive answer was despatched.

The administrative officer's "in-tray" contained a form of application for a loan: it was within the limits prescribed for a man on the applicant's salary, and the form had been endorsed by the Chairman of the Council's Finance Committee; all that was now required was the District Officer's recommendation. Most participants signed the recommendation without hesitation, but it was pointed out to them that this was not a very urgent matter and that bureaucratic caution was here not out of place. A careful look at the form revealed that the applicant *himself* had also signed it as "Acting Treasurer"; several sections of the form had not been filled in, whilst a cryptic marginal note alongside read "No longer required under new Estimates format". Possibly this was indeed in order: but full marks were given to the man who minuted on the covering letter – "Please ask the Acting Treasurer to come and see me *personally*, bringing with him the new Estimates and Financial Memoranda . . ."

This item was one of several demonstrating the importance of reading carefully anything that was to be *signed*. Amongst the papers were a couple of routine letters typed for signature. The first had omitted the date and needed another minor correction: but it was pointed out that since really accurate typists are relatively rare in Northern Nigeria and in up-country Uganda, it was reasonable to make trivial handwritten corrections and to allow this letter to issue without re-typing. The other letter, however, contained appalling mistakes of spelling and grammar, and the typist had even included, from the manuscript draft, the phrase "Please type this for my signature – Thanks"[7]. More than 60 per cent of all participants signed this letter without correction, and all were equally horrified when we reviewed the exercise afterwards: if nothing else, this experience ensured that few of the participants would ever again sign papers unread.

This demonstrates perhaps the most conspicuous benefit derived from these exercises. In all cases the participants had often been exhorted to be methodical and careful in their work, and had been shown techniques of office management and coached in bureaucratic procedures. But it was not until the enormity of their *own* mistakes lay stark and incontrovertible in front of them that those earlier discussions came alive and became meaningful.

Emphasis was constantly placed on the literal meanings of the words in the phrases "*civil servant*" and "*public servant*". The importance of courtesy and patience in dealing with members of the public was reiterated. Thus, when an application for employment was being considered, it was pointed out how much more pleasant it was for the applicant to receive a standard reply which was *friendly* – e.g. "I regret that this office does not make such appointments. You should apply to the Public Service Commission on the enclosed form" – rather than the far more familiar cold douche – "No vacancy". Other points that emerged were the importance of acknowledging letters that could not be dealt with at once; and the tiresomeness for the recipient if very different subjects were dealt with in a single letter.

Helpfulness within the office was also encouraged. Every Nigerian "in-tray" contained a letter in Hausa and another in Yoruba. Practically none of the participants were able to understand both languages: but they could invariably recognize them for what they were, and agreed that in minuting to the clerk it was a good idea to suggest, e.g. "Please ask Mr. Adewunmi if he can read this for us", rather than unhelpfully to command "Translate and return". Responsible delegation was praised, whilst on the other hand participants were urged never to refer decisions unnecessarily to higher authority – a besetting sin of civil servants in developing countries: "a good subordinate is a filter, not a funnel", they were reminded. One or two items called for tact – e.g. explaining to a new Councillor that his motion had been submitted too late for consideration at the imminent Council meeting and would have to be deferred; or accounting to another Department for a procedural mistake without revealing that the mistake was in fact the fault of one's own superior officer.

A comparative assessment of the participants' handling of their "in-trays" is by no means easy, and militates against the successful use of this technique for competitive examinations. An imaginative participant, for instance, might perceive that the best way of handling one problem would be to take it up personally with a member of the Council: if he therefore endorsed the item "BU 19/5 for discussion with Councillor Dada after Council meeting" he would get a good mark; but if he merely wrote "BU 19/5" was he to be given the benefit of the doubt? Again, should one allot many marks to a student who prepared a long and admirable draft speech for the Emir, a job he could safely have postponed for a week or two, whilst he failed altogether to deal with trivial jobs of great immediate urgency? One item was from Post Office Headquarters to inquire whether a certain postmaster's request for compassionate leave was justified: was his mother really ill, as he alleged? Most students sensibly sent messages by the swiftest available means to the chief executive in her home area, 60 miles away; but some replied forthwith, confirming the lady's illness. When challenged, one explained: "I happened to have seen her in the hospital the night before, when I was visiting a friend . . ." Full marks for quickness of wit! but should his fellow students be assumed to have been equally imaginative?

---

[7] The writer has himself twice had such letters presented for his signature, so this enormity is not far-fetched. It need hardly be said that *all* the "in-tray" items were based on actuality.

Such considerations make it almost impossible to devise any wholly satisfactory system of marking these exercises. For my own part I found it simplest to allocate 100 marks between the various items, weighting the more important items by allocating extra marks to them, and keeping a few marks in reserve to reward particularly imaginative or intelligent action. This subjective approach distinguished sheep from goats very adequately for classroom purposes, but has undeniable limitations for competitive assessment.

Inevitably the background material sometimes proved inadequate but, on the whole, this problem was not serious. For example, the terrain and the weather could make a difference to an official's plans but, for the first, his imagination could have free play and, for the second, the date would always indicate more or less what might be expected. All three "in-trays" used at Zaria were set in "Tanadi", an imaginary Emirate with characteristics typical of many former Native Authorities[8], especially in the Hausa areas of the former Northern Nigeria. The first "in-tray" belonged to an Administrative Officer of a State Government, appointed as the State's representative – the Divisional Officer – in the Emirate. The second belonged to the Administrative Secretary of the Local Authority Council. And the third belonged to the Clerk of a new Area Council created within the Emirate[9]. The second of these (if the traditional titles of office are ignored) is perhaps the official position most commonly paralleled in other parts of the world, and so I append at Annex 3 a summarized version of this particular "in-tray", with most of the introductory material. At a recent seminar for Town Clerks at Uganda's Institute of Public Administration I devised a similar "in-tray", which was well received.

---

[8] Recent reforms have abolished the "N.A."—now variously re-named Local Administration, Local Authority or Local Government Authority—in the six States comprising the former Northern Nigeria.

[9] This exercise was devised specifically to take into account recent reforms in the North-Central and Kano States.

ANNEX 1

Question 10 of "Workshop" in Public Administration, Final Examination: 13 June 1969.

10. Case Study

Action Required

Set out clearly your plan of action for the next 24 hours, including your proposals for any delegation of responsibility.

Write in the examination book provided, *NOT* on the items themselves.

Background

You are Ahmadu Buba, Administrative Officer in charge of Gellesu Division, a small Emirate in North-Eastern State, Nigeria. All-weather roads lead to Provincial Headquarters at Bauchi (100 miles West) and to State Headquarters at Maiduguri (200 miles North). The only significant towns outside Gellesu itself are a big railway junction at Sokoja (30 miles South-West); and a market town at Gongoluna (25 miles East), where there is a voluntary agency hospital and a teacher training college (T.T.C.).

Other Staff

You have a clerk and a messenger (with a bicycle) at your office. The Assistant Inspector of Education is at Gongoluna, preparing for the ceremonial opening of a new Women's T.T.C. The Agricultural Officer is away on a course and the Produce Officer is on tour near Sokoja. The local authority headquarters has a normal establishment of staff. The sergeant (traditionally entitled Sarkin Yan-Doka) is in charge of 40 policemen in Gellesu, and a further 20 men are stationed in neighbouring Districts; operational control is exercised by an Assistant Superintendent of Police at Nigeria Police provincial headquarters in Bauchi. Sarkin Yan-Doka told you on Saturday that he was afraid tribal leaders were using discontent about cotton prices to stir up trouble: in riots last year three people were killed, and Sarkin Yan-Doka does not think he has enough men to handle serious disturbances.

Communications

The telephone line is not working, and telegrams are unreliable. Many lorries travel up and down the trunk road from Bauchi to Maiduguri which passes 10 miles north of your headquarters. Most vehicles, including your own car, are out of action owing to shortage of spare parts. The local authority has one Land-Rover and two 5-ton lorries in working order; and the Chairman of the Education Committee has a new private car. Your friend, Simon Manchester, the manager of the cotton ginnery, has a car and a pick-up, and there are one or two privately owned lorries in the town.

Situation

After doing some business at the Catering Rest House, you arrive in your office at 8 o'clock on Monday morning, 9 February, 1970, and you find the appended five urgent papers on your desk.

Item 1

MEMORANDUM

From: Provincial Secretary, Bauchi
To: Divisional Officer, Gellesu
Subject: Opening of Women's T.T.C., Gongoluna—10/2/70
Date: 4th February 1970 Reference: EDU/9/47

I have unexpectedly been called away on tour this week-end, so I shall be driving direct to the above ceremony. Please arrange to meet me at Gongoluna Mission at 9.30 a.m. on Tuesday, with a draft speech for the Military Governor, so that he and I can have a look at it before the opening ceremony at 11 o'clock. You will have to meet the UNESCO representative, Professor Fernandes, on Monday and bring him with you.

PROVSEC

Item 2

TELEGRAM

MD 034 MDG32 MDTAPE 12/79 MAIDUGURI 43 0702 0954 AM
EXECUTIVE GELLESU
VIP/32/70 FERNANDES WITH WIFE AND DAUGHTER ARRIVING SOKOJA BY TRAIN 1445 HOURS MONDAY STOP GRATEFUL ARRANGE ACCOMMODATION TRANSPORT TO GONGOLUNA
MINEDUCATE

Item 3

GELLESU NATIVE AUTHORITY

URGENT
(By Hand)
The Divisional Officer,
Gellesu.

Waziri's Office,
Gellesu.
9 February, 1970

Dear Sir,

POSSIBLE THEFT OF FUNDS

I regret to inform you that two vouchers (total value £1,169 7s. 9d.) have just been brought to my attention by the Accountant in this office, which appear to have been forged. They are signed by Mallam Tsofo, the Storekeeper, and countersigned by Mallam Audi, the Works Supervisor. The Works Supervisor and the Storekeeper are not present, please.

Yours faithfully,

Treasurer,
Gellesu Native Authority.

Item 4

THE BRITISH COTTON GROWING ASSOCIATION (NIGERIA)

(incorporated in Nigeria)

Gellesu Ginnery,
P.M.B. 103,
GELLESU

From the Branch Manager, Gellesu
PERSONAL & CONFIDENTIAL

Sunday evening 8/2/70

Dear Ahmadu,

I am very worried by a report that has just been brought to me by Hassan Fulfulde, the Secretary of the Maigida Cooperative Society, which is the Licensed Buying Agent for the area between here and Gongoluna. Some of the cotton farmers have been critical for a long time of the management of this cooperative and, of course, they are all furious because this year's cotton price is so low. Fulfulde tells me that the discontented farmers (about 50 of them, he thinks) are planning to meet on Tuesday morning at Hasima's Bar in the Sabon Gari and that they have decided to set fire to the cotton stacks at the Ginnery here. They are already buying cans of kerosene and are clearly in an ugly mood.

We have something like £200,000 worth of cotton in the stacks now, so please can you do something quickly? I shall be waiting for you at the Ginnery office from 8 o'clock tomorrow, Monday morning.

In haste,
Yours,
(Simon)

Mallam Ahmadu Buba,
Divisional Offices,
Gellesu.

Item 5

JUDICIAL (NR) FORM 3

Sections 47, 158, 163, & C. C.P.C.

NORTH-EASTERN STATE OF NIGERIA

In the High Court of North-Eastern State

Case No. MD/15C/1970

Between Commissioner of Police Complainant
and
Bature Dereba Defendant

Summons to a Witness

To Ahmadu Buba of Gellesu

WHEREAS complaint has been made before me that Bature Dereba of Sokoja has (or is suspected to have) committed the offence of Causing Death by Dangerous Driving C/S 23 Road Traffic Law at roundabout on Abubakar Road, Gellesu at 5.15 p.m. 6/12/69 (state the offence concisely with time and place) and it appears likely that you can furnish material evidence:

You are hereby summoned to appear before High Court at Maiduguri on the 10th day of February 1970 at 9.0 a.m. o'clock to testify what you know concerning the matter of the said complaint and not to depart thence without permission; and you are hereby warned that if you shall without just excuse fail to appear on the said date, a warrant will be issued to compel your attendance.

Dated this 2nd day of February 1970.

Registrar

ANNEX 2

Question 3 from paper on the *Principles and Practice of Local Government* set for Local Government Advanced Certificate Course 1969/70: final examination—June 1970.

3. You are the Treasurer of Sokoja Local Authority. One morning you arrive at your office and find the following matters to be dealt with:

(a) A letter from the Provincial Secretary confirming approval of a loan to yourself for the purchase of a 200 cc motor cycle.
(b) A message from the Chief Accountant to say that he is sick and will not be coming to the office today.
(c) A signed acceptance of an offer of pensionable appointment for Mr. Jaja Wahabi as an Accounts Clerk at the bottom of the "E" scale (£198 per annum).
(d) A telephone message from the Sub-Treasurer at Gongolwa to say that a high voltage electric cable has blown down and is lying across the door of his office.
(e) A message from the Cashier reporting that there is £1,200 missing from the safe.
(f) A letter from Burumburum Motors Ltd., to say that, unless they hear from you by 10.00 o'clock this morning, they will sell their only remaining 200 c.c. motor cycle to someone else.
(g) A messenger from the Emir instructing you to come as soon as possible to discuss next year's Pilgrimage arrangements.
(h) An application from M. Jaja Wahabi, Accounts Clerk, for a loan of £150 to buy a motor scooter.
(i) List these items *in the order* in which you would propose to deal with them, starting with the most urgent. If two or more are connected, you should link them with a plus (+) sign. Thus, your list might start: (a)+(f); (g); (d) . . .
(j) Explain briefly *why* you select this order, adding relevant comments *about each item.*

ANNEX 3

"In-Tray"—Administrative Secretary Tanadi Local Authority

Background You are Nuhu Zamani, the Administrative Secretary (Turaki) of Tanadi, an imaginary Emirate in the South-Northern State of Nigeria. It has an area of about 5,000 miles and a population of about 250,000 (45,000 taxpayers). Provincial Headquarters is at Garia, 40 miles to the south. Owing to shortage of administrative staff your friend the Divisional Officer is temporarily in charge of two Divisions: he is living at the headquarters of Gondo Division, 60 miles north of Tanadi Town across the River Ja.

On 1st April 1970 the old Native Authority was abolished. A new Local Authority Council has been nominated by the Military Governor of the State. Only two of the new "Portfolio" Councillors have much previous experience of local government: namely your own superior, Waziri, who used to be a Headmaster and is now Councillor for Administration and Local Government; and Sarkin Zana, the Councillor for Finance, who was once the Treasurer. The other "Portfolio" Councillors are Ciroma (Natural Resources & Cooperatives); Sa'i (Works); Wambai (Health); and Dan Iya (Education). There are seven Districts (see map).

In your own office you have under you a Chief Scribe; two typists (one of them newly appointed, the other on leave); and two messengers. You and Ma'aji, the Treasurer, are the only members of staff with Stage III (Local Government Advanced Course) certificates. (The Development Secretary, also normally in your office, is away on a Stage III course).

All the L.A. departments have their headquarters in Tanadi Town, where there are also some State Government officers—viz: an Asst. Inspector of Education; a Livestock Officer; an Asst. Registrar of Cooperatives; and a Community Development Assistant. There is also an Asst. Supt. of Police. At Kongo, which is on the trunk road through Gashi and Egan, there is a Works Supt. (Roads) with an office and a workshop; also in Kongo is an Agricultural Officer; a Post Office; and a General Hospital with two doctors. There is a Voluntary Agency (V.A.) hospital at Bojo. There is a Government Boys' Secondary School in Tanadi; a V.A. boys' secondary in Bojo and another in Gashi; and a V.A. girls' secondary school and a teacher-training college in Gellesu.

The Situation Today is Friday, 15th May 1970. You have been on sick leave for 6 days, and when you returned to work this morning you saw that a considerable amount of correspondence had accumulated in your "In-tray". You had no time to deal with it because of an unexpected visit by students from the Institute of Management at Garia. Monday is a Public Holiday for Id-el-Maulud and on Tuesday there is a Council meeting. So you have decided to return to the office after working hours this afternoon to clear up as much of your "In-tray" as possible.

It is now 4 p.m. and, apart from a messenger with bicycle, you are alone in the office. There is no telephone and your motor-scooter is being repaired by Tanadi Motors Ltd.

Time available You have 2 hours. You are anxious to get through as much work as possible, since you plan to spend the holiday visiting your mother at Gellesu.

(These background papers, which were given out to participants at least one day before the exercise took place, were rounded off with an explanation of the action required and the methods to be used; a calendar of the months May and June, 1970; and a map of the "Tanadi Emirate").

Items in the "In-Tray" of 15 May 1970

IT(2)1: Agenda for Council Meeting at 10 a.m. on 19 May, with note from Chief Scribe (senior clerk) explaining that this had already been sent out by him in your absence.

IT(2)2: Request from Canadian High Commission for confidential report on a former employee of Tanadi L.A. Treasury; minuted to the Chief Scribe, who now replies that he was not here at that time but believes the man concerned was dismissed for drunkenness.

IT(2)3: Request (in Hausa) from an unofficial village development committee for help in roofing an adult literacy classroom built by voluntary labour.

IT(2)4: Telegram from Ministry of Education—AWAITING REPLY MY NCY/L/13 OF 20TH MARCH X MUST KNOW BEFORE TRAINING CONFERENCE: Chief Scribe has minuted that he cannot trace letter referred to.

IT(2)5: Details of this year's allocation of funds for roofing materials for Community Development projects; asking for urgent submission to Provincial Office of list of approved projects.

IT(2)6: Confidential inquiry from P. & T. Headquarters as to genuineness of a Postmaster's application for compassionate leave to visit seriously ill mother.

IT(2)7: Instruction from newly appointed Councillor ordering that a motion about redecoration of offices be added to agenda of Council meeting on 19 May.

IT(2)8: Demand from Insurance Company for full payment of claim resulting from alleged collision between their client's car and a Tanadi Council vehicle the previous Sunday evening.

IT(2)9: Petition (in Yoruba) for help in retrieving a young wife said to be forcibly detained by her Hausa parents after visiting them.

IT(2)10: Message from Typist saying that after everyone else had left the office a missionary had called in with news that a bridge on the only motorable road from Gondo had been washed away by a storm.

IT(2)11: Copy of letter from Education Officer to Emir asking him to open a Headteachers' Seminar "on Saturday 5 June 1970"; passed to you by Waziri (*see Background*) with instructions: to draft a speech for the Emir; to prepare a list of guests to be invited; and to check the date (5 June being a Friday, though Waziri does not point this out).

IT(2)12a: Letter for your signature: undated, and with 1 word omitted, but otherwise satisfactory.

12b: Letter for your signature: dealing with two unrelated topics, and containing a dozen spelling mistakes, as many grammatical errors, and the phrase "Type for me to sign—thanks".

IT(2)13: Request to Supt. of Works from Registrar of Co-operatives asking for chairs to be supplied from Council Chamber for meeting with U.N. Adviser at 9.30 a.m. on 19 May: copied to Ciroma (*see* Background) who wants to know why he hasn't been invited himself.

IT(2)14: Booklet, marked "SECRET", containing *Security Instructions*: with note from Chief Scribe—"What should I do with this?"

IT(2)15: Request from Provincial Office for list of all staff eligible for proposed upgrading course; passed down by Waziri with the comment: "We *cannot* spare anyone now".

IT(2)16: Delayed letter from Military Governor's office notifying the District Officer (in Gondo) that the Committee for Local Government Reform has unexpectedly decided to visit Gondo and Tanadi Emirates, starting in Gondo this very day, and driving on to Tanadi on 19 May, after the holiday: this copy forwarded to you by safe hand with urgent plea from D.O. for appropriate arrangements to be made in Tanadi, whilst he looks after the Committee in Gondo.

The Ombudsman and the Permanent Commission of Enquiry*

By MARK KIMICHA

Mr. Justice Kimicha is Chairman, Permanent Commission of Enquiry, Tanzania.

THE concept of the Ombudsman originated in Sweden as early as 1807. It arose from the need to protect the Swedish citizen from undue interference, negligence or errors by government officials. From Sweden it has spread to many parts of the world. However, wherever this institution is found, its primary function is essentially to complement the existing methods of protecting the individual from maladministration. The Ombudsman for Tanzania is the Permanent Commission of Enquiry but its role has been deliberately modified to suit the local needs and conditions.

The Presidential Commission appointed by the President in 1964 to report on the possibility of establishing a Democratic One Party State, recommended among other things that there should be an institution which would be charged with the task of safeguarding the interests of the individual against purely arbitrary or discretionary decisions and against abuse of power, but such an institution should not have the effect of limiting the actions of the Government and the Party in a way which would hinder the task of nation building. To this end, when the Interim Constitution of Tanzania was passed in 1965, Chapter VI created the Permanent Commission of Enquiry with no executive powers.

Apart from the general desire to guard the individual's rights against maladministration, in Tanzania there were other motive forces behind the establishment of this new institution. Among these was the fact that the rights of the individuals were not guaranteed in any formal way by, for example, the Constitution or by a Bill of Rights. Therefore, it was of vital importance that the Judiciary remains independent of both the Executive and the Legislature. In addition to this, the Courts have always been overworked. Hence the need to provide a cheap means, one free from technicalities in dealing with purely administrative acts or decisions. Furthermore, the one party state system increased the powers wielded and responsibilities shouldered by some office-holders. One individual could act in different capacities both in the Party and in the Government. Thus unless a proper system of checks was in force, there would be a very real danger that abuse or misuse of power or position to the detriment of the citizen might occur with importunity. Again it must not be forgotten that immediately after independence, there was, for obvious reasons, a crash programme of localizing the administration. It was therefore inevitable that a relatively inexperienced civil service found itself charged with the enormous task of implementing an ever increasing flow of social legislation. At the same time, there were dynamic development projects geared towards the eradication of poverty, ignorance, disease and the major task of seeking to instil into the young nation the spirit of self reliance. As it can be seen all these great changes touch and concern the citizen either individually or as an integral part of Tanzania society. It was therefore necessary to safeguard the individual's rights from the blunders of the inexperienced civil servant and possibly of an over-zealous executive.

---

* This paper was originally prepared for an address given by the writer at Addis Ababa in 1971.

The Permanent Commission of Enquiry derives its powers from the constitution. It is established by Section 67 (1) of the said Constitution and it has jurisdiction to investigate the conduct of a broad range of governmental, party and parastatal officials in the exercise of their authority, or in abuse thereof.

The Commission can thus deal with arbitrary decisions or arrests, omissions and improper use of discretionary powers; decisions made with a bad or malicious motive or decisions influenced by irrelevant considerations; unnecessary or unexplained delays and obvious wrong decisions.

The enquiry begins whenever the President so directs, and unless the President otherwise directs, the Commission always makes such enquiry if it considers that an allegation of misconduct or abuse of office or authority by any person ought to be investigated.

Apart from Presidential directions, the Commission receives complaints in either written form or orally. In the former case, no particular form is prescribed and in both cases no fee is charged for setting investigatory machinery in action.

By law every enquiry is conducted in private which means that members of the public and press are excluded. In practice when an enquiry is being made and persons are called upon to give evidence, such persons come one at a time and in the absence of the person complained against. When a *prima facie* case is established the Commission may call upon the person complained against to make his defence. In practice, all persons complained against are accorded an opportunity to defend themselves.

When receiving evidence, the Commission is not bound by the Law of Evidence and a decision is made on the balance of probability.

The Commission has the same powers as the Courts of Law and Judicial Tribunals for compelling the attendance of witnesses and has access to all information, documents, papers or other material but the President and the President only, can direct that such and such information or document should not be made available to the Commission if the production of such information or documents might prejudice the security or defence of the State, or the investigation or the detection of offences, or might involve the disclosure of cabinet deliberations.

Members of the Commission and Commission decisions are protected by law to the same extent that judicial officers and their decisions are so protected.

Furthermore, members of the Commission cannot be called upon in a court of law to give evidence in respect of matters they learnt in the course of their duties.

After the investigation, the Commission must report the proceedings of every enquiry, and of its conclusions and recommendations thereon, to the President who may take action as he thinks fit.

The Commission may report to the President even though the act or omission has been corrected. In practice, however, not every allegation made and investigated by the Commission is reported to the President. Whether or not the case is so reported depends largely on the nature and gravity of the case and in some instances, the willingness of the official concerned to correct his mistake. Likewise recommendations made to the President depend largely on the nature and gravity of the particular situation involved. The Commission could recommend that an official be warned, demoted, transferred to another department or to another area, or be dismissed. If his activities amount to crime then it will be recommended that he be prosecuted in a court of law, and if he has occasioned an injury to the rights of an individual, then he may be called upon to compensate the individual concerned.

All in all, the Commission in every case has to decide what should be done to the official complained against and what should be done for the victim. As stated before, the Commission has no executive powers and the President is not obliged to accept the Commission's recommendations. He may thus warn instead of dismissing the individual and *vice versa*.

The jurisdiction of the Commission extends beyond the Party and the Government bureaucracy to practically all statutory public bodies and Party affiliates in the State. However, it has no jurisdiction to investigate the President of Tanzania nor the Executive of Zanzibar. Again, as may be repeated once more, the Commission has no executive powers but simply reports to the President who then takes action as he deems fit. Thus there could be no useful purpose in making the Presidency subject to investigation by the Commission. So in short, no decision, action or order made by the President can be challenged. Lastly, the Commission has no jurisdiction over the East African Community, private companies, missions, the Armed Forces, and Judicial decisions although it is able to investigate the conduct of magistrates outside their strict decision-making functions.

Up to June, 1970, the Commission had received a total of 5,494 complaints; out of these, 2,814 were taken up for investigation and 2,680 were rejected on one of the following grounds:

(a) that the complaint was frivolous, vexatious, trivial or not made in good faith; or

(b) there was no substance to warrant further investigation; or

(c) under the law or existing administrative practice, there was an adequate remedy or right of appeal and the Complainant has not exhausted it; or

(d) having regard to all circumstances of the case any further investigation was unnecessary; or

(e) the case arose many years before; or

(f) after a preliminary investigation, there was no *prima facie* case against an official; and

(g) it was against government policy.

Out of the 2,814 complaints investigated, 1,005 cases had been completed and so far 372 were successful and 633 were not. The remainder were still under investigation. From the foregoing one can see what the Commission is actually doing to protect the individual where previously grievances simply went unanswered. And even the unsuccessful cases can be of value as a help to strengthen the morale of those complained against, enabling them to know that what they did was not considered wrong and that is why the complaint did not succeed.

Finally, it must be pointed out that some people have levelled severe criticism against the institution in its different areas of operation. The first and most serious of them all is that the report of the Commission does not disclose to the public as to what extent the President has accepted or rejected the Commission's recommendations. And that even where he has rejected them, no reasons are given for his doing so. The answer for this is short. To please our critics here would be to make the President as the head of the State open to unnecessary criticism, a concession which would in no way advance the cause of justice for the individual in Tanzania.

The next criticism concerns the secret nature of the Commission's proceedings. It was decided to take such a line in order to ensure that the people who give evidence before the Commission are not victimized by the people complained against. This is all the more important when we remember that most of the complaints are lodged against people in authority, people who could be in a position to victimize or intimidate others.

The last criticism is that the Commission's lack of executive powers has somewhat reduced its effectiveness. This is a very hard allegation to prove. However, as already pointed out, the primary function of the Commission must be to complement the judiciary and other administrative bodies in protecting the rights of the individual and not to replace them. And the short experience of the Commission's work has showed that its lack of executive powers is distinctly to the advantage of the Commission and of the public.

What of the success of the Commission? Psychologically, many citizens and people in authority in Tanzania are aware of the existence of this young institution especially created and equipped to protect them. On the other hand, figures can also show what has been going on in practice. Arising from complaints investigated during the four years ending in June 1970, the Commission has persistently pointed out such defects in the law and in Civil Service Regulations that have come to its attention during the course of its work. Several amendments to the law and to the regulations have been put into effect, in consequence. Likewise, the Commission has commented adversely on some undesirable trends in the administration. In fact instances of arbitrary decisions and acts by those in positions of authority have diminished noticeably in the last few years.

The credit for the great success of the institution must be given to the President himself. Judging from the number of complaints submitted to him for action and other matters of State which require his attention the casual observer might entertain the view that a President would give no more than cursory attention to the Commission's reports and that his attention would be much more attracted to matters which affected the State as a whole and not to personal grievances. But this is not the case with the President of Tanzania. The writer has been personally much impressed since his appointment as Chairman of the Commission to see how much time and attention Dr. Nyerere gave to each report. In worthwhile cases he has made manuscript comments at considerable length.

His pen has not spared even cabinet ministers if their conduct happened to be under consideration.

The public and officials who come under the purview of the Commission are aware of the President's determination to see to it that the Commission fulfils the purpose for which it was created and is not merely a prestige institution.

Public confidence in the Commission has also contributed a great deal to its success. The public know that they can send in their complaints under secret cover and that their secrecy would be kept by the staff of the Commission. They also know that the Commission would make an honest and sincere attempt to redress their just grievances.

Lack of formalities and technicalities and bureaucracy have also enabled it to live up to its requirement of being an institution for prompt redress obtainable at low cost. Furthermore, honest and conscientious public servants know that they have nothing to fear from the Commission.

The Permanent Commission of Enquiry has already proved that it is performing a useful and much needed service and it is the writer's sincere hope that it will always be an integral part of the Constitution of Tanzania.

Quarterly Notes

UNITED NATIONS – *Urbanization in the Second Development Decade*

Goals for the next decade at the national level might include:

i. Urban development itself must be recognized as a major factor of economic growth in national development plans. Urban plans must also (a) take account of the urban and environmental consequences of other national measures of economic growth; (b) allocate and schedule urban growth in terms of location requirements, environmental capacity, and the size and nature of cities and towns best suited to the nation in question; and (c) estimate the land required for urbanization, the needed equipment and materials, and necessary investment.

ii. Urban development and housing authorities or departments should be created and provided with sufficient power to purchase land for urban growth, check speculation, encourage and undertake research for the development of building materials and housing components, and train people in the wide diversity of skills required for the effective development and management of cities. Such authorities would, when necessary, develop special programmes to improve conditions in the shanty towns. They would also assist in developing and implementing regional planning. They should be represented at the highest level of development planning.

iii. A full-scale urban and regional development strategy should be adopted in which urban location and form would be used to stimulate the most productive and diversified use of the nation's resources and fulfil national housing goals.

iv. A full array of savings and credit institutions should be established to mobilize capital and to channel investment into housing and related services.

v. Urban studies and research centres should be established or expanded, to organize the interdisciplinary efforts needed for a genuine urban strategy at the national and regional level.

Goals for the 1970s at the international level might include:

i. Substantial additional international resources should be provided in the form of financial aid and technical co-operation to achieve national goals for housing and urban development.

ii. An international housing finance system should be developed to stimulate the creation and growth of national housing banks and savings institutions.

iii. A network of internationally supported major research and training centres should be established in all developing regions and sub-regions.

iv. The international organizational structure should be strengthened to deal with the full magnitude of the housing and urban crisis.

v. All international and national agencies concerned should undertake a campaign to arouse public concern over the problems of accelerating urbanization and the steps needed to reverse the trend towards deepening crisis. This is, after all, the crux. Without general awareness of the urgency of these problems it is unlikely that the proper action will be taken.

Human settlement itself stands as a dynamic monument to man's vision of his potential in society. That vision cannot be allowed to falter at the very time when the human potential rises to its highest level.

Source: UN Department of Economic & Social Affairs Report ST/ECA/132

NEW ZEALAND – *Conference of Town Clerks*

A strong plea for greater emphasis on balanced regional development was made at the 40th annual conference of the Institute of Town Clerks.

A senior lecturer in history at the University of Otago, H. A. Morton, advocated a "social consequences tax", which would be designed to force industry to assume a large part of the burden which a freely chosen location in an overcrowded region would force the ratepayer to bear.

He said that unlike other developed countries, New Zealand still had time to plan its urbanization so that cities could offer all the advantages of size and as few of the disadvantages as possible.

"To those who argue that securing balanced growth will be both difficult and expensive I answer that it will be infinitely less so than solving the problems of uncontrolled growth after they have become almost intractable", said Mr. Morton.

He argued that the present negative policy of almost complete non-interference in the siting of new plants and the moving of head offices was a policy that favoured the regions which least needed favouring.

A social consequences tax would place the burden alongside the benefits of locating industry in a crowded region.

"In short there would be inducement to locate in regions which are under-developed and penalties for locating in an area considered over-developed."

Urban Congestion

It had been said publicly, and recently, in New Zealand that those of us who pointed out either the present or the future problems of regional urban concentration were merely expressing nostalgia for rural values and the rural past, Mr. Morton continued.

"If wishing to breathe pure air, to drink pure water, to walk safely in a park, to travel quickly and easily to work, to know and to trust my neighbours, is to be nostalgic, then I plead guilty. Nostalgia or not, it is apparent that we must regain our sense of community, and excessive size is the enemy of community.

"All city planners emphasize community; therefore all city planners are concerned about size.

"I am convinced that we can retain a reasonable environment, regain a sense of community, and still get the undeniable benefits of urbanism only if we ask questions about the size of cities, only if we try to find the answers, only if we plan with these questions and answers in mind.

"No one needs to claim omniscience in order to see the danger that Auckland will become another Los Angeles and Wellington another Baltimore.

"The pollution of sea and air, the problems of transport and traffic, the iniquities of group and race conflict, the dangers on the street, all these things that disgrace Los Angeles and Baltimore are being faithfully copied in Auckland and Wellington, and Christchurch and Dunedin too for that matter", said Mr. Morton.

"The evidence exists and cannot rationally be denied. For us the important thing is not to recognize the symptoms but to determine that the disease must be cured.

"It is being tackled in other countries but at immense cost in money, in effort or perseverance. Only New Zealand, of all countries with a comparable standard of living, has a chance to prevent as well as to cure.

Cost of Negative Control

"It is accepted by practically every urban expert that the scale and the type of problem encountered are directly related to the size of cities. This can hardly be denied by the economic experts who argue the advantages of scale.

"For just as a large city concentrates the wealth to support a great art gallery or orchestra or theatrical group, so does it concentrate the wealth to support the Mafia. Just as a large city concentrates the talent for the orchestra or the theatre, so does it concentrate the talent for the gang – if one can use the word talent for abilities perverted to sterile and uncreative purpose.

"And, unfortunately, we must realize that the social costs of crime may outweigh in the minds of many people the social benefits of the arts.

"Therefore urban congestion finally produces a willingness to spend much more on negative control than on positive creation. For the costs of crime are not only high in the direct sense, of theft and assault and arson, but also in the preventive sense."

Source: *New Zealand Local Government*, June 1972

INTERNATIONAL – *Local Finance*

The International Centre for Local Credit at The Hague has started publishing a new international bi-monthly journal, "Local Finance". Articles are published in English, French or German with summaries in the other two languages.

PAPUA, NEW GUINEA – *Administrative Training*

Over the last decade the number of local officers in the Papua and New Guinea Public Service has risen steadily, reaching 70 per cent of the service by mid-1971. The number of expatriate officers on permanent and pensionable terms has steadily declined.

Papuans and New Guineans are thus in a position to assume much greater responsibility for the administration of their country – the formal structure of the public service presents no major barriers to them.

In 1961 a departmental committee report contained a strong recommendation that a residential training institution be established in Port Moresby to provide courses in administrative procedures, induction and core subjects for trainees from several fields.

There followed a Ministerial direction that a new institution begin operations in 1963 as the Administrative College of Papua and New Guinea, absorbing the existing functions and staff of the Public Service Institute.

The Administrative College's permanent buildings were completed during 1967; offices, classrooms, dining hall and dormitories in February of that year, recreation hall in May, library in August and assembly hall in November.

The Administrative College at Waigani has resident places for 311 officers and trainees and a teaching capacity of some 400, in 15 classrooms, five seminar rooms and a language laboratory. From the moment of completion, these resources have been used to their full capacity, or beyond.

During 1967 and 1968 the College provided numerous facilities for the University of Papua and New Guinea, which possessed very limited residential and teaching recources in those years. Most of the general education and training courses which the College established in 1964 have expanded considerably in recent years. By the end of 1971, the numbers of officers to have completed studies have included:

Stage I	176
Stage II	515
Diploma in Administration ..	34
Local Court Magistrates ..	68
	793

Two of the original training courses, for typists and stenographers, subsequently became the responsibility of the Papua New Guinea Department of Education.

In the seven years of its operating, the Administrative College has provided training courses of one year or longer for 1,150 local officers of the Papua New Guinea Public Service.

In 1970 the Administrative College introduced the first of its programmes designed to train local officers to assume senior positions in the public service. This was the Advanced Management Course, which was conducted for a group of fourteen over a period of some seven months.

Included in the course were a number of officers who had completed the College's long courses (notably the Diploma in Administration) and had progressed to higher stages of the Executive Development Scheme. The Advanced Management Course dealt with the majority of officers who were, at that time, ready to move into higher-level executive positions.

The programme, which began in early 1971, is in three stages – Introductory Management Courses of two weeks, Middle Management Courses of eight weeks and Advanced Management Courses of fourteen weeks. There is no fixed entry level for the courses, since officers' prior training, occupation and aptitudes for general administrative work must be taken into consideration.

Between June 1971 and the end of 1972 it is proposed that the management training programme will include:

Type of Course	*Number of Courses*	*Number of officers attending*
Introductory management	15	300
Middle management	6	90
Advanced management	1	15
	22	405

As is the case with all courses at the Administrative College, management training concentrates heavily upon practices and problems in the specific Papua New Guinea situation. However, this approach succeeds only so long as the training staff are in close touch with the rapidly changing situation in the country.

The time is fast approaching when local officers will themselves have to take a larger part in the preparation and presentation of courses at senior levels. For this reason, the College will assist with a post-graduate study programme designed to allow officers eventually to gain higher degrees. The first stage of the programme will begin in 1972. Assistance to the public service's Senior Administrative Programme, designed for top-level officers, will commence at about the same time.

Source: *Australian External Territories*, Vol. II, Number 4, 1971

BRITAIN – *Ombudsman for Local Government*

The Minister for Local Government and Development announced in the Commons that consultations were now proceeding for the establishment by law of a Commission for Local Administration to investigate complaints of maladministration by local authorities; the proposals put forward were for implementation in April 1974, when the new councils would come into operation; the system would involve the creation of an independent statutory commission comprising a number of local commissioners, each responsible for a particular area of England; although the commissioners would be appointed by the Crown, they would be responsible to a body representative of local government, which would also finance the commission.

Source: *Hansard* – 16/5/72

UNITED STATES – *Development of Urban Information Systems*

Viewed broadly, the Urban Information Systems Inter-Agency Committee (USAC) is a dynamic mechanism for channelling federal resources to improve local government administration. Its specific purpose is to facilitate inter-governmental co-operation in urban information systems research and development. USAC is important because it is simultaneously conducting an experiment in product research and development and in administrative organization. The anticipated products are operationally based and integrated information systems. The administrative organization is an evolving network of relationships among many governmental and private units designed to build the prototype systems.

USAC grew out of a unique set of circumstances at a particular point in time. Among the main influencing conditions were: (1) the creative federalism movement, (2) urban information systems research conclusions, (3) evolving perceptions of information needs, and (4) facilitating legislation.

Research conducted particularly in municipalities lent initial validation to the following propositions:

i. Federal agency data requirements from local governments are substantially common. The data essential for local government operating systems are sufficiently common to federal requirements to warrant their consideration as a primary source of data for meeting those needs.

ii. High commonality of data requirements exists among local governments. Data needs can be conceived in systemwide terms and provision made for generating such data as a by-product of local government operations, thereby making it possible to provide economically feasible solutions to the data generation problem.

Several features of USAC's charter merit elaboration:

i. USAC is intended as a federal inter-agency and an inter-governmental co-ordinating mechanism.

ii. Although USAC chose to direct its initial efforts towards municipal information systems, it may support information systems development for all local governments including area-wide agencies.

iii. While the USAC Committee can establish funding requirements and priorities, it depends on the willingness of member agencies to provide fiscal support from their appropriations.

iv. The legal base for USAC's financial structure, which permits funding contributions from the departments and agencies, rests upon the provision for pooling federal funds in the legislation of two member agencies: the Office of Equal Opportunity and the Department of Justice.

v. By necessity, USAC operates as a consortium of equal partners: each relies on the participation and financial support of the others to maintain its own participation and support; each brings a federal and local perspective that the others require; each provides special resources that permit the group to do collectively what no one member can do individually.

vi. USAC's organization, an approximation of the collegial model, represents a departure from traditional federal hierarchical structures.

USAC is a particular administrative mechanism, shaped by an intergovernmental operating environment, and formed to fulfil a specific need: urban information systems research and development. It has established a larger administrative vehicle to carry out its goals, and that vehicle appears to be functioning well. Looking ahead to completion of the current research programme, USAC appears to be at an important point in its evolution.

Finally, from the standpoint of the field of public administration, USAC's particular function, useful though it may be, may be less significant than its form and context. A central problem in creative federalism has been to integrate for specific goal achievement the numerous, diverse, and loosely linked units in the society within an administrative framework that permits the flexibility that each requires. The form adopted by USAC was a set of contractual relationships – first among its member units and then between one of these and several outside entities, each of which formed other contractual relationships, eventually resulting in an operant administrative vehicle. Thus, a spin-off utility of the USAC mechanism may lie in its potential as a general model of flexible administrative organization, especially suited to the framework of creative federalism. That model also appears useful for initiating and testing other innovative programmes within a complex inter-organizational environment.

Source: *Public Administration Review, No.* 5

USA – *The Empire State College*

Empire State College is the newest experimental component of the State University of New York. Its aim is to permit persons of college age and beyond to enrol for an associate in arts or baccalaureate degree and to pursue, under faculty direction, an independent course of study through correspondence work, multi-media instruction, occasional seminars, and other unconventional means tailored to individual interests, motivations, and experiences.

Having no campus of its own – only the co-ordinating headquarters in Saratoga Springs – the College will eventually be linked academically through "learning centres" to the network of seventy existing SUNY campuses spread throughout the state.

These centres will be staffed by a dean and two full-time associate deans who will identify educational resources in the community, thirteen faculty mentors, and any number of tutors, who may or may not have traditional faculty qualification but who are judged to have the most to offer the student. Of all of them the person with whom the student will have the closest continuing relationship will be the faculty mentor, who will contract with the student for a coherent educational plan (with approval of a faculty committee), guide him toward manageable goals, and play a crucial role in the evaluation of the student's achievement. This relationship will be maintained throughout the programme of study unless the student changes his or her field of concentration. When in full operation each centre will be able to accommodate about 500 students.

The great advantage of this programme is that it will provide almost limitless flexibility for students to progress at their own pace according to their own capabilities and circumstances. They may go to college full time or half time for an agreed-upon period of study that may cover a month, a quarter, or a year as work, vacation, and other schedules permit. Each period of study will be evaluated by means of written examinations, proficiency tests, essays or term papers, research projects, and ultimately by a faculty committee, before the next round is begun, allowing students the option to change direction between learning contracts if they desire. Tuition will be the standard $550 for completion of a year's work or its equivalent.

Admission into Empire State will be on a first-come first-served basis. Although the only entry requirement is a high school diploma, the College will be geared to mature persons with some college and work experience, who are highly motivated and have clear goals. Some testing and screening will be necessary to establish an entry level that should roughly correspond to sophomore, junior, or senior standing. Since there is no time limit on obtaining the degree, those students without good high school preparation may begin with remedial work; others can move ahead as fast as their time and motivation allow.

Three non-residential patterns of study will be tested in the programme: all work off campus; a semester on campus combined with off-campus study; and off-campus with short-term seminars on. These patterns will be monitored and evaluated over a three-year period by an inter-campus faculty committee.

Within each pattern of campus study a student will make a sustained effort in one of three basic modes of learning, even though his total college experience may encompass elements of the other two. The discipline mode will provide major concentrations and course offerings in anthropology, economics, English, fine arts, geography, history, mathematics, philosophy, physics, political science, psychology, and sociology.

The problem mode will be offered in the social and behavioural sciences, the arts and humanities, and in science, mathematics, and technology.

Students who choose the experience mode will have the opportunity to integrate into their academic programmes accomplishments and experiences not ordinarily recognized in traditional, residential study, such as privately contracted piano or dance lessons, language skills achieved through special classes or travel, apprenticeship positions in nursing and teaching, and on-the-job experiences in business and industry.

Each of these modes of learning will eventually utilize various techniques and technologies, including textual materials, audio and video cassettes, open and closed circuit television, correspondence and independent study, residential workshops, and seminars. Only a limited range of resources will be available at first.

The College has received the endorsement and support from the State with an allocation of $1.5 million over a three-year period.

Who are the students who will be going to Empire State College? According to an informal breakdown of the more than 10,000 unsolicited inquiries about the programme thus far, most have come from New York City, where there is no State University campus. They are for the most part from women, from persons in business and other white-collar occupations, from students transferring from two- and four-year state institutions, and from high school students. This breakdown conforms pretty closely to at least one market projection which concludes that potential students for non-residential degree programmes will be primarily adults, many of them women, and many of them in white-collar occupations, who see the opportunity of obtaining better jobs and a means to a more satisfying life with a college degree.

Source: Annual Report Carnegie Corporation of New York, 1971

BRITAIN – *Special Programme in Urban Development Planning*

The education of a professional planner takes seven years. In seven years the population of many major developing cities will increase by anything from 50 to 100 per cent. The administrators and managers in these fast growing cities cannot wait for seven years. They have to act now to cope with the thousands of newcomers in their charge.

The Development Planning unit of University College, London, with the help of the Overseas Development Administration, is running a Special Programme designed to meet their needs. It consists of a three month course held annually from April to June. This course is intended primarily for those involved in urban growth problems, but deals also with many national and regional policies that affect urban development. It aims to give participants an overall appreciation of the latest thinking in urban development techniques whilst preparing them for an active role in their country's urban situation.

The Special Programme is held at the headquarters of the Development Planning Unit at No. 10-11 Percy Street, London WIP 9FB.

Book Reviews

Prospects for Employment Opportunities in the Nineteen Seventies, Ed. Ronald Robinson and Peter Johnston; *HMSO, London;* Cambridge University Overseas Studies Committee; vi, pp. 246; £2.00.

Anyone wanting a quick brief on employment problems and prospects in the third world would do well to spend an evening with this report of the 7th Cambridge conference on development problems, published in October 1971. This was the 7th in the unique series of Cambridge conferences on development which bring together academics and government officials from some forty countries, to discuss some aspect of development strategy. The form of the conference leads to a good blend of contemporary academic thinking tempered by the reactions of civil servants with their feet firmly on the ground (or at least on the pavements of the capital cities if not always in the mud of the rural areas). The tendency of the academic to create new fashions (as John White perhaps too cynically observes in his summary of the conference) is thus offset by some healthy scepticism from civil servants resisting at least the non-obvious attempts to divert their attention from obvious problems.

The book, like the conference, is divided into six sections, each focused on a major topic of the conference and each summarised in personal impression of the conference discussions by John White, Gerry Meier, John Londsdale, Martin Godfrey and Phil O'Brien. These six sections cover the introductory paper on the employment problem in developing countries by the former Director-General of the International Labour Office, David Morse; four case studies on the dimensions of the employment problem based on experience in Colombia, India, Kenya and Cuba; a general section on employment, strategy objectives and choices; and three sections on policy focused on rural employment, urban employment and international policy and its effect on employment. In addition, the book contains a number of appendices listing the conference organizers, participants, programme and the agenda for discussion in plenary session. The whole report is put together in a straightforward style, equally easy to refer to as a record of the conference or as a guide for non-participants to what the conference discussed.

David Morse's paper on the employment problem in developing countries provides a measured, though general introductory statement of the conventional wisdom in 1970 about the employment problem. Somewhat provocatively he characterized the far-reaching implications of employment strategy as amounting to a dethronement of the gross national product as the chief goal for planning and the chief measure of performance in development. In spite of the careful qualifications with which Morse surrounded his so-called dethronement, the very use of the word released a hare into the conference which thereafter kept popping up in different places in the discussions, usually causing 2 or 3 conferees to give chase. John White's personal summary of the conference discussions successfully analyses the sense and nonsense behind the over-simplified concept of dethronement, but instead of concluding that Morse's balanced formulation – though not his use of the word dethronement – was very resaonable, instead concludes that *employment* perhaps had been dethroned.

The four case studies provide useful specific examples of how the employment situation differs in different countries. Not merely are these useful in themselves but they provide a factual basis for the differences in context which the conference concluded were essential for understanding the nature of the employment problem. Dudley Seers' four-page summary of the ILO Colombia mission is really too short to indicate more than the main headings of the points made in the full report. K. N. Raj and Dharam Ghai both give brief but interesting accounts of employment performance, prospects and policies in India and Kenya. Brian Pollitt's summary of employment plans, performance, and prospects in Cuba is of particular interest, particularly because much less is known about the Cuban situation and because by the test of employment creation, Cuban development strategy has been remarkably successful. Cuba, since the Revolution in 1959, is one of the few countries of the third world to have moved from serious labour surplus to labour scarcity.

The third section on strategy, objectives and choices contains papers on wages policy by Elliot Berg, political and social aspects of employment policies by David Turnham and on rural-urban migration by the author of this review. Berg and Turnham both provide competent summaries of issues on which they have written influentially and more fully elsewhere. The central paper of this section concerns conflicts between output and employment objectives by Frances Stewart and Paul Streeten, already much quoted as the clearest analysis so far of the issues involved. Not surprisingly they conclude that possible conflicts between employment maximization and growth are more complex than might be supposed from the frequently repeated assertions that we must sacrifice output to employment. Not only current but also future levels of employment (as well as output) must be taken into account, as must certain structural features of the economy, particularly the pattern of savings, technology and income distribution. In fact, it is likely that any conflict arising between employment and output objectives will be a question of different preferences for an entire time profile of output and employment, or in other words, a question of the relative weight to be given to current against future employment.

The fourth section on rural employment is brief and selective (though the conference discussion on this theme was not). Schumacher puts the case for an effective Development Industries Extension Service, analogous to an agricultural extension service but promoting rural industrialists, artisans and traders instead of better farmers. Guy Hunter, in a paper published in this journal in October 1970, offers some wise and sensible comments on the need to sort out from the mass of partly relevant factors those which are vitally significant for the purpose of agricultural modernization. This is not merely of academic interest but of strategic importance for designing rural programmes in which government resources are concentrated when they are most effective.

The papers by Dennis Akumu on the role of trade unions and by George Foggon on the role of employment exchanges are both brief but stimulating contributions in areas where criticism is much more common than constructive thought. Akumu, Secretary-General of COTU, Kenya's central organization of trade unions gives some pithy, balanced arguments for trade unions in third world countries trying to work out an appropriate special relationship with government – something between total independence which he believes is impractical and continuous intervention from government which would frustrate the unions legitimate activities. Akumu's whole paper rings with a sense of practical challenge to both academic theorists and government advisers to devise incomes policies which take account of a range of specific issues too often ignored. Foggon's paper, only four pages, summarizes the well known reasons for thinking employment exchanges to be of limited value in countries of limited opportunities for modern sector employment but then moves to the less explored question of what revamped employment exchanges might actually do. Rightly he emphasizes a range of additional activities, most designed to achieve a better understanding of the employment situation rather than to find jobs for job-seekers. Foggon avoids many of the more impracticable suggestions for reform. If one criticized his suggestions it would be for giving insufficient emphasis to the range of informal sector opportunities, and informal ways of finding jobs, which at present exist - and asking how they could be improved.

By contrast, Yesufu's paper seems somewhat complacent towards the rapid increase in urban real wages of the 1960s, too ready to justify them on the grounds that urban living standards are low, and giving insufficient weight to the fact that rural living standards are often much lower.

It is in section six, however, that the range of international influences which are so closely linked to employment problems is explored, unfortunately in only two papers. Hans Singer maps out the field – trade, aid, private foreign investment, science and technology, international liquidity. Drawing on his enormous range of experience Singer notes the crucial issues and tosses off penetrating comments and proposals on some of the specific forms in which they currently arise. While generally constructive in approach he is not sparing of more critical judgements – unlike Geoffrey Chandler, who, while making good points, strikes too uncritical a note in analysing the effects of private foreign investment and deals insufficiently with the negative aspects of overseas investments, and with the important questions of what can be done about them.

In spite of the range of this impressive and wide-ranging volume, there are with hindsight, several gaps: there was in general a tendency to analyze employment in too aggregate terms, with little attention to the particular forms and causes of specific employment problems – unemployment among the young, the educated, among women. Nor was there enough attention on "informal sector employment" – the range of usually unenumerated activities providing easy-to-enter, small-scale, low-income, but modestly productive employment in both urban and rural areas. Finally, the distinction between the different forms of unemployment problems is not kept in clear enough focus – frustration over the inability to obtain the sort of job one seeks gets merged with the related but distinct problem of jobs of low productivity – and both are not clearly enough distinguished from the problem of low incomes from work. Unless each of these "problems" is separately identified, analysis of the magnitude of the different types of employment problems, their causes and solutions get confused. Concern with employment problems is both a concern to ensure a reasonable share of the national income for every family and with the need to ensure that the labour force is productively employed in ways which offer a sense of participation and individual fulfilment. If this stimulating volume makes clearer the need for making these elements essential components in the development strategies of even a few of the countries represented at the conference the volume will have made an important contribution.

RICHARD JOLLY

Political Roles in a New State: Tanzania's First Decade, by RAYMOND F. HOPKINS; *Yale University Press*, 1971; $12.50.

Mr. Hopkins' study of Tanzania's political system in the first ten years since the country became independent is founded on a series of interviews with legislators and senior civil servants. He, or a Tanzanian colleague, saw for an average of two hours apiece 51 civil servants out of the 157 of requisite seniority, and 58 of the 185 members of the National Assembly. This was in 1965, but the writer has obviously continued to be a close observer of the Tanzanian scene subsequently and has kept track of the later careers of those with whom he talked at that time. His object was to see how the "political élite" in a newly independent ex-colony, saw their own roles in society; and how their conceptions of the parts they played and expected of others were helping to formalize the political rules of the game in the new state.

The roles that are brought under examination are those of the administrators, the legislators and the President. The interest of this field of study is plain enough. In any newly independent country there are no indigenous traditions to underpin the structure of a modern state. Indeed, the attitudes bred in the leaders by the run-up to independence are more likely to threaten the structure. If a party in the United Kingdom is out of office for a few years, its members will not find it entirely easy to shed the reflexes of opposition and to assume the responsibilities of office. How much more difficult for a party which has hitherto existed only to oppose, and to oppose not merely another party but the entire system of government itself. Equally, the administrator trained in colonial days was brought up in a system that was political through and through; he will not find it easy to adapt to political masters.

By and large Mr. Hopkins gives an encouraging picture of the process of adaptation. The top administrators, now *permitted* to join the party, accept that in practice they *must* join, and they accept readily enough that they must respond to political direction. But they retain, after all, that part in policy formulation which always falls to the lot of a capable civil servant. Nor are they cut off from more direct political roles, for Mr. Hopkins tells us that several have been posted as Regional Commissioners, with the membership of the National Assembly which goes with the office. He might have added, too, that there are openings for them in other posts with a high political content, such as Chairman of the National Bank. Nevertheless, the job is less overtly political than in the past, but in compensation there is the enlarged task of "nation-building" to be performed.

The legislators, too, are able to adjust to a changed role. Mr. Hopkins repeatedly makes the point that the system of politics as it is developing in Tanzania is largely closed, in that controversy will be given free rein within a hierarchy of party groups and committees and it is there that agreement must be thrashed out. By the time that legislation is before the National Assembly, the fundamentals of party policy are no longer in issue and criticism is confined to detail. This state of affairs is justified by the fragility of the new state. A peasant economy, 108th in wealth per head in a league of 122 nations, a low standard of education, risks of tribalism, such factors make public threats to unity dangerous, whether they come from another party or any other form of pressure group. The argument seems acceptable to the members of the National Assembly, although it does not appear that those interviewed were all fully aware of the restraints on the part they play.

The almost unlimited power in the hands of President Nyerere and the corresponding burden of responsibility are well explained, and the objectivity of Mr. Hopkins does not disguise his respect for the way both have been exercised. He duly faces the inescapable question of how such power might be used in the hands of another and finds his best hope in the President's own respect for the law. Given time, he feels, such self-restraint may become a hallmark of the office rather than a characteristic of the present incumbent.

There are some interesting asides in the book. Zanzibar remains hidden from the reader; few of their legislators consented to be interviewed. The Chagga and Haya, with 7.3 per cent of the population, provided 38 per cent of the cadre of senior administrators. The Parliamentary Question, as in the United Kingdom, is a much less efficient way of eliciting useful information than a private word with the Minister or the right civil servant.

If the author had conducted his interviews and had then set down his sensible conclusions in the same clear and precise English as distinguishes his brief political history of Tanganyika in his first chapter, his book would have been an unmixed pleasure to read. Alas, it transpires that the interviews are to be turned into computer programmes and in Chapter 2 the reader is subjected to a dreadful change for the worse. What is the ordinary reader supposed to make of words like "normative", "societal", "specifity", "complementarity"; of phrases such as "role concept", "macro process"; of a sentence which tells him that "displaced motives and cathected objects will make some roles seem desirable"? He has a choice. He may read and re-read until he has an opaque understanding of what may be intelligible at once to a tiny group of sophisticated statisticians. Or he may skip Chapter 2. Either way, he will break through into relatively sunny highlands where Mr. Hopkins tells him the results of his inquiries in language which reminds him of Chapter 1.

Mr. Hopkins is cool, objective, sensible, just. He can write clearly and well. He recognizes that he is dealing with people, each of whom is unique; had he not stuffed them into computers, he would have written a very good book.

K. I. MEEK

Local Administration in West Africa, by RONALD WRAITH; *George Allen & Unwin,* 1972; pp. 236; £2.75 Hardback; £1.35 Paperback.

Mr. Wraith has spent many of the post-war years as an administrator or teacher in West Africa, and has played a part in, as well as studying the development of, local government there since the British Government, under the impetus of Creech Jones and Andrew Cohen, first started the drive to develop local government on the English model. This was intended partly as a means to provide new social services, partly as a foretaste of democratic responsibility before independence arrived. Now, some dozen years after independence, the purposes are changed, and in some parts of these countries the idea of local government is being abandoned, in others it has collapsed in a confusion of crude politics and crude corruption. But yet it may well have served its original purpose as well as any other possible line of progress.

Mr. Wraith first wrote on this subject in 1953, when the process was just beginning, and hopes were high. He revised his book in 1962, just as Independence dawned. Now he has re-written most of it, in the light of the disappointments and changes of the last few years.

He writes simply, aiming his work more at the African student, councillor or administrator than at the American or English Political Scientist. There are therefore no chapters on methodology or on advanced political analysis, but rather a straightforward account of what has happened, and why it has happened. (Though a student could be mystified by such a statement as that on page 77, that a council "is a 'body corporate having perpetual succession and a common seal and having the power to sue and be sued'. This means that the council is the local *authority,* upon which the Government lays certain powers and duties, which may tax people for local purposes, and which must accept responsibility for good government for such matters as are within its competence". The fact is, it does not mean this.)

Though the book is obviously intended for readers in West Africa, it will be of real value to students in this country and elsewhere. As a straightforward account and assessment of this particular episode in history it is admirable, well informed, comprehensible and justly critical.

BRYAN KEITH-LUCAS

Cameroun: An African Federation, by NEVILLE RUBIN; *Pall Mall Press,* 1971; pp. 259; £3.00.

This is a further book in the useful Pall Mall series on the history, politics, economics and cultures of individual African countries. It is readable, sound and well-informed, without making any great pretensions to originality: more than half of the text is anthropology and colonial history, drawn from secondary sources. This is not an error of balance as it might seem, since

Cameroun's recent history is unusual and its effect on present-day patterns of life has been massive. The deep cleavages between North and South, steppe and forest, which can be seen in many West African countries were overlaid here by other lines of division in the period of French and British rule. Political groups and the administration followed different paths, and even the language of public affairs was different in each of the two dependencies which came together in 1961.

Given so many divergent interests within the same state, a leader's task is necessarily a balancing act. Goals must be kept simple to attract widespread support, and the head of government has to be a reconciler and pragmatist. President Ahidjo is supremely this; he came to power as a moderate, a northerner who always had to work with a largely southern-based executive and civil service. From the time of Federation onwards he has faced the additional task of uniting the government of a French-speaking eastern and an English-speaking western state, and the author's study of the problems of unification – political, economic and social – is the most interesting part of this book. He also gives a comprehensive description of the structures of government and administration, a rather summary treatment of the economy, and a few pages on Cameroun's external affairs.

The clash between two political traditions was symbolized when the federal constitution came to be drafted. Ahidjo, originating from the larger unit and with the personal status of a Fifth-Republic style president, got most of the provisions that he wanted. The English-speaking leaders hankered after a parliamentary system and were granted this at state level, while the federal government became presidential. The concession might appear something of a poisoned gift, since the state governments* are now collectively responsible to their legislatures, while the President is responsible to no one but the voters who elected him.

A few criticisms can be made of the book. There is really too much law in it for a general study, and the explanation of government and administration in Cameroun is strongly legal/descriptive (however the inclusion of Mandate and Trusteeship texts in the appendices, as well as that of the present Constitution, was altogether worth while). A period of field research would have brought more understanding of the problems of administration and development in areas away from the large towns – in particular, the author makes no mention of the lively experiments with representative rural communes in Eastern Cameroun, which were unique among the Francophone countries of Africa. In the historical section, it is implied at page 12 that the French were effectively practising "indirect rule" in the North – whereas the actions described on pages 50 and 51 correctly show the very "direct" nature of the system.

Anyone who writes about this country faces at the start the agonizing question of whether to call it the Cameroons, Cameroun or Cameroon. Each of the spellings has a good claim, but surely, for references to the modern state, we should now adopt the Federal government's practice and spell it Cameroon in English?

Philip Mawhood

**Cameroon became a Unitary State since this review was written.—Ed.*

Development Administration – the Kenyan Experience, Ed. GORAN HYDEN, ROBERT JACKSON and JOHN OKUMU; *Oxford University Press;* appendices, bibliography; pp. 366; £2.60 (hardback), £1.50 (paperback).

A group of social scientists based on the University of Nairobi have produced a "national case study" of development administration in Kenya. To quote James Coleman's foreword, the intent is to add an empirical study of a particular administrative system in the Third World to the mass of "macro level generalization" which typifies so much of the literature in this field.

The design is generally well conceived. In the opening section chapters by Hyden, Okumu, Bienen and Lacey describe the environmental forces acting on Kenya's administrative system – the conflicting influences of the colonial style of government and of traditional African society, the post-independence social, political and economic milieu and the impact of foreign aid and investment. This is followed by an examination by Leonard, Leys, Ouko and Hyden of the internal administrative practices of the Kenyan bureaucracy including its personnel management in general, its recruitment and training policies in particular, and its problems of language, delegation and communication. A third Part comprises a description of the formal machinery for planning and implementation by Jackson, and a micro study of this in action by Holmquist. The relations of the central bureaucracy to local authorities, trade unions and the co-operative movement are reviewed by Mulusa, Sandbrook and the ubiquitous Hyden and an "overview" is attempted in Jackson's concluding chapter.

It is a tribute to the editors that a coherent picture emerges from 14 chapters by 11 different authors – the picture of a highly centralized, hierarchical, compartmentalized bureaucracy, stratified increasingly by wealth as well as rank; a civil service deeply, often arrogantly, but not always justifiably, conscious of playing a crucial role as the modernizing élite; powerful but impeded by its members' efforts to underpin their newly acquired social status with a surer foundation of personal wealth; continuing and reinforcing the institutions and behaviour of its colonial predecessor, topees and all. Its performance is affected considerably but diversely by political pluralism – on the one hand by a ruling political class lacking the cohesion or determination to enforce accountability by the bureaucracy or to direct its policies effectively; on the other by diffuse local interest groups highly successful in extracting resources from the centre and in manipulating and distorting central policies at the implementation stage.

Any book with so many contributors is bound to vary in quality. John Okumu's succinct and accurate summary of the socio-political setting of Kenyan administration is outstanding. So is Frank Holmquist's fascinating study of a cattle-dips programme in Kisii District which shows a developmental initiative at district level weakened and distorted by inconsistencies and vacillation at the centre – both over time and as between interested ministries – and by the varying objectives and standards pursued by the local interest groups in the County Council and self-help associations co-opted to augment government resources. The chapter on Central Government and

Local Authorities is particularly disappointing since it is not only inaccurate (e.g. produce cesses *have* been collected in some parts of the old "white highlands" and have not yet been abolished in most areas, as stated on page 247) but accepts at face value Government's declared reasons for emasculating the County Councils. In fact, as the recent Ndegwa Report tacitly admits, Government policy has been far more responsible for the financial collapse of these authorities than their internal failings.

In their Introduction the editors contrast two contemporary approaches: the "ecological" approach exemplified by Riggs which focuses on the impact of the social, political and economic environment on administration, and the "development administration" approach seeking institutions and methods by which administration can have a developmental impact on its environment. The editors profess a desire to pursue the latter – to examine how public administration in Kenya might "be made more innovative, . . . efficient and productive" and its execution "more effective". Regrettably the book only really succeeds in the former – in its "ecological" study of the Kenyan bureaucracy. With one honourable exception there is little realistic prescription – little to guide the civil servant in amending the amply depicted errors of his ways.

This failure to live up to the book's own pretensions, has three possible causes. The first is a failure to analyze what development is or is not taking place and how the administration is or should be contributing to it. Though only recognized on the penultimate page "the achievements so far have been substantial", particularly a radical and enviable increase in the productivity of smallholder agriculture which has helped Kenya to maintain a high growth rate despite the erosion of the large scale farming sector on which its prosperity traditionally rested (an erosion far greater in practice than on paper). Such analysis needs further to specify the deficiencies in Kenyan development – the maldistribution of wealth and opportunity is an obvious example – and to indicate the remedies which the administration should be applying. This would clarify the priority areas for reform. For development administration is not just a matter of creativity and innovation; there are many roles and skills demanded. The institution or individual who combines them all effectively is a rare paragon, and the priorities for these propensities vary in time and place.

Secondly, the book is obsessed with the misleading distinction between administration "for development" and "for control". The two are inseparable. Civil servants may have innovative ideas but the opportunity to implement them usually arises from some external threat to equilibrium; it was Mau Mau, after all, which gave impetus to the Swynnerton Plan. Moreover development enhances the need for control as it disrupts established patterns of life and sharpens competition for resources and opportunities. The book would have been much better if this idea had been explored in the opening rather than the closing paragraph. It could well be that the developmental policies which the authors would most applaud, require on analysis a more intensive use of control mechanisms – an effective tax system, for example, to help redistribute wealth.

Finally there is repeated reference to the inappropriateness of the classical Weberian bureaucratic model without specifying what could be changed. Indeed Holmquist's micro study shows a development scheme failing through lack of bureaucratic behaviour in appointing qualified cattle-dip staff, controlling their operations and enforcing regular use and payment by the cattle owners.

There are three implicit criticisms of the Weberian tendencies of the civil service. The first relates to its compartmentalism and lack of delegation which hinder integrated approaches to rural development. This is extremely valid; a logical conclusion would be to recommend the type of decentralized structure now being introduced in Tanzania with departmental field staff laterally responsible to a Regional Director controlling finance, planning and personnel and responsible to the Prime Minister's Office. Reading between the lines, the Ndegwa Commission came to the same conclusion but was frightened off by the likely resistance of the line Ministries – another example of the impact of political pluralism. The second criticism relates to the absence of field leadership qualities from the criteria – mainly educational and professional – upon which staff are recruited. This again is a valid point but how important is it? One is faced again with the pursuit of the paragon. Granted that people vary in their qualities, which matter most? There is a good deal of evidence that personal persuasion is less effective in field extension work than astute pricing policies and competent provision of inputs, marketing facilities, transportation, etc. Personality is important but no more so than objectivity and professional competence; one must beware of men who are capable of leading others – but only up the garden path. What Kenya needs is practical measures such as prolonging the duration of field postings and more specific but participative work programming which would enhance the self confidence of the field staff and thereby draw out their capabilities for influencing local communities.

The third implicit criticism of the Kenyan bureaucrat is that he is too "regulation minded". This is based on Bernard Schaffer's argument that rule consistency is alien to the perceptions and expectations of the peoples of developing countries and therefore has heavy costs in terms of individual initiative and popular satisfaction. This criticism ignores several points. Rule *in*consistency is liable to have even heavier costs as the Bukedi riots in neighbouring Uganda demonstrated. As one of the editors has pointed out elsewhere, many of the accusations levelled at the Kenya civil service concern its *in*consistency in enforcing rules – its nepotism, particularism, etc. A government can only afford to relax "regulation mindedness" where it can be certain that its servants will use their discretion with integrity of purpose and conformity of values – as Leonard points out in his Chapter. Similarly, willingness to "depart from the book" where commonsense dictates, depends on self confidence, experience and a professional consciousness of overriding objectives. The more self-assured Kenyan administrators are only "bound by the book" when it suits them. The important thing is not to relax respect for rules and procedures but to change them so as to accelerate decisions and to release local initiative while maintaining uniformity of purpose. There is a good deal of experimentation with such reforms under the

Special Rural Development Programme in which other members of the University have been productively engaged; it is a pity that the book was published a little too early to include this part of the "Kenya experince".

An exception is Robert Ouko's chapter on Personnel Management, which advocates a number of reforms in internal management practice echoed subsequently in the recommendations of the Ndegwa Commission. They are perhaps conventional prescriptions in the Fulton era of administrative reform, but as a practitioner the author, formerly a Permanent Secretary and now a Minister, knows what degree and direction of reform are possible given the likely continuity of bureaucratic dominance in the Kenya Government. But if the book is generally weak on prescriptions, the accuracy of its ecological portrait of the Kenyan bureaucracy has been well borne out since its publication. For twelve months since publication of the Ndegwa Commission proposals for comprehensive reforms to remedy some of the deficiencies so amply described by Okumu, Hyden *et al*, the only recommendations implemented are the provision of staff cars for permanent secretaries and a salaries revision – which despite its claims to the contrary, enhances the existing disparities within the service.

KEN DAVEY

Administration and Development in Malaysia, by MILTON J. ESMAN *Cornell University Press; Ithaca and London*, 1972; pp. 341; £5.95.

In the post 1945 reconstruction, the role of governments in Malaysia widened from the central colonial function of control towards a more directive economic policy. New social services were established and programmes of rural development were launched for the replanting of rubber smallholdings (which quadruples yields) and the opening up of large areas of new land for settlement. The unitary structure of administration was split into embryo ministries some of which were put in the charge of local political leaders. The administrative service began to recruit its Malay intake from the universities (instead of by promotion from below) and from 1953 onwards took one fifth of its local recruits from the non-Malay communities (Chinese, Indians and others). But there was no significant attempt to modernize civil service training and working procedures. With independence in Malaya in 1957 two-thirds of the administrative posts, held by British staff, gradually fell vacant and were filled by the promotion of local men of mature years trained in the old ways and further direct recruitment of younger men whose abilities were, however, frustrated by the heavy weight of traditional attitudes in the ranks above them.

Yet the leaders of the newly independent country demanded of the civil service a faster tempo and a greater efficiency than before. Faced with a mediocre performance, Tun Razak, then Deputy Prime Minister, called in as his adviser, the Professor of Government from Cornell with the task of promoting new and better methods. This book is a report on that three-year mission.

The author begins with an analysis of the context of his problems, i.e. the politics, communal relations and state of the civil service in the mid-1960s.

Throughout the book he shows himself a shrewd and clear-thinking observer with an excellent grasp of his subject. The main criticism of his introduction is that the history, which is all-important in understanding the current situation, apparently does not interest him (his bibliography ignores the authoritative works of his fellow American, Lennox Mills). The next section of the book defines the author's objectives and he then recounts his actual experiences, giving half a dozen detailed case histories. No other observer has combined these powers of analysis with the opportunity of observing the civil service from inside. It is a record of unique and outstanding value.

The Malaysian bureaucracy reacted to these new notions somewhat predictably. The rural development ministry, the show-piece of Malaysia, said that its system was already "perfect" (p. 262) and shut its door against innovation altogether. The author, for once abandoning his philosophic detachment, gives a scathing account of the ossification of what was once a dynamic organization. His plans for advanced training for the administrative service and improved budgetary planning and control suited the book of the personnel and financial departments who proceeded to implement them in their own fashion and with a firm refusal to allow the author to advise on the practice of what he had preached. Conflicts over industrial development were only resolved by putting the same civil servant in charge of both competing organizations.

Professor Esman obviously knows his way along the corridors of power. At the outset he saw that he must respect Malay views on the structure and composition of the civil service and confine himself to its internal improvement. He kept his lines open to ministers and used their intervention, when he could secure it, to good effect. This reviewer can detect the distant thunder of the guns. Above all the author gathered round him and trained a group of able and enthusiastic young converts. He rightly believes that the future of what he began lies with them.

In the latter part of the book the author develops his prescription for the solution of race relations problems in Malaysia and his view that the civil servants and politicians (many of them former civil servants) must operate as a strong élite rather than as a democratic instrument of their divided nation. These passages are less convincing as a practicable programme and they are somewhat obfuscated by the academic disposition to use long words instead of short ones.

Taken as a whole this is a valuable record and a stimulating set of ideas. One respects the author not only for what he has written but for the manner of his performance in Malaysia.

J. M. Gullick

Great Cities of the World – Their Government, Politics and Planning, Ed. William A. Robson and D. E. Regan; *George Allen & Unwin, London,* 1972; Third Edition, 2 vols. – each Vol. with select bibliography, maps, tables, index; Set of 2 Vols., pp. 1114; £18.00.

In a world where phenomenal urban growth over the past two decades confronts the governments of many nations with well-nigh insoluble problems of mammoth size, Professor Robson and Dr. Regan are to be congratulated on producing this third edition to their original and stimulating standard work on great cities.

In the revised synthesis, William Robson identifies a number of major problems which, despite the inevitable differences in detail varying from country to country and from city to city, nonetheless have a sufficient degree of similarity as to provide common problems mainly due to similar causes, in all the great cities round the world. These are summarized under the following headings: *First*, Organization of areas and authorities – with emphasis on the need for a "constitutional framework of a great municipality which corresponds with the facts of population, territorial size, mobility, social and economic life in the last quarter of the twentieth century" – more centralization ("the administrative integration of the whole metropolitan area for the large-scale services") *and* more decentralization ("compact units of local government to perform the functions which can best be administered by smaller municipal organs"). While reforms have been introduced in London, Montreal, Paris, Stockholm and Toronto, "most great cities are left to struggle . . . with out-of-date structures and powers".

Secondly – Popular interest and democratic participation, Professor Robson sees the low level civic interest as the cause "for great cities like Paris, Buenos Aires, Delhi, Mexico City and Calcutta to be virtually governed by (central government appointees) with only nominal or limited power, if any, given to the representative organs".

Thirdly – Efficiency of the municipal services: inadequacy of highways, public transport, housing, water and sewage works, the problems of overspill, air pollution and noise. He blames public apathy, excessive bureaucratization of the city government, "sheer insensitivity on the part of elected representatives" (presumably where they have some say and some power).

Fourthly – Finance – "a chronic state of financial stringency appears to be a permanent condition of many metropolitan cities" both rich and poor ones. "Finance is all too often the Achilles heel of the metropolis. The cost of services and especially of land . . . is seldom matched by the higher yield of taxes".

Fifthly – Planning the metropolitan region, Professor Robson believes that "many of the most difficult problems can be solved only by imaginative planning and drastic development or renewal (slum clearance, elimination of over crowding, more open spaces and amenities); this requires the whole metropolitan region to be planned appropriately – "it must comprise both town and country within its scope. It must prescribe what shall be done not merely what is forbidden". Authorities to carry out the plans at all levels with adequate powers, jurisdiction and resources, are essential.

Professor Robson believes that with a fair measure of enlightened government the cities of the future can continue to play a great part in the history of mankind just as they have in the past, intellectually, artistically, politically. These two excellent volumes contain contributions by specialist authors from many different lands. For urban planner and urban policy maker, for City and Central Government legislator, the editors have provided basic reading – not just food for thought, but guidelines from which there is scope to evolve a better urban life for the ever increasing millions of mankind for whom there is no real alternative to town life. Urbanization cannot be halted any more than Canute could halt the incoming tide, so let our rulers take note and seek to make urban life bearable for rich and poor alike.

P.H.J.

Sudan Today – A handbook published for the Ministry of Information in Khartoum by *The University Press of Africa;* appendices, bibliography, maps, index; pp. 204.

This is an amalgam of the old Sudan Almanac, a modern Europa-type business man's reference book, a P.R.O. hand-out, and a short historical geography of the Sudan.

It succeeds in combining these functions with a degree of factual impartiality as rare as it is refreshing.

It seems to be the work of several hands, not all of them Sudanese, judging by one or two slips in transliteration, but the source material has been skilfully used and written up into a coherent series of articles by somebody with a gift for simple English prose. The criticisms are pertinent and moderate, and credit is given where credit is due (e.g. to Kitchener over the Gezira Scheme). Even the section on the South is non-controversial, and the statement of the southerners' case by Oduho and Deng in their "Problem of the Southern Sudan" is included in the comprehensive bibliography side by side with "Basic Facts".

The only obvious omission from the bibliography is O. G. S. Crawford's classic, "Fung Kingdom". The maps are clear and uncluttered, though the tribal end-paper has got the Messiria, the Nuba and the Shilluk a bit out of position. The excellent selection of illustrations includes a fascinating space photo of the Sudd.

The political section indicates clearly that General Nimeri's whole foreign policy hinges on hostility to Israel – the close association with Egypt and Libya as front-line allies, the establishment of friendly or neutral relations with the uninvolved African states in the rear, the termination of hostilities in the south (a prolonged drain on military resources), and the swing-away from the U.S.A. to the U.S.S.R.

The general's brand of national socialism is not to be interpreted, however, as a result of outside associations. Like Nasser before him, he had become completely disillusioned with democratic institutions and politicians of all kinds. He therefore determined not only to abolish the representative assemblies but to suppress the popular movements from which they were fed – the Communists, the Mahdists, the student organizations and the more fanatical Islamic bodies. According to p. 56 of this book "opposition to the idea of an Islamic constitution was one of the main factors behind the revolution of 1969". The Islamic University of Omdurman was closed down within a few months of the general's assumption of power.

Efficiency is his watchword and the abolition of local government by councils is an obvious step in that direction. Judging by past experience, however, the elimination of the authority of tribal and territorial heads is unlikely to have a similar result, involving as it must an expensive new local Bureaucracy and a cumbersome apparatus for the enforcement of law and the settlement of petty cases, civil and criminal.

On the economic side, the appeal for foreign investment in productive enterprise will not be helped by the unexplained reference, after the nationalization of banks, import agencies and insurance, to "seventeen companies" whose cash and property were confiscated (p. 119). What, one is bound to ask, was their offence? Even Shylock was allowed to retain a life interest in half his capital.

Of the degree of efficiency achieved one has, of course, insufficient data to judge as yet. (The retention of unproductive prestige air routes to foreign capitals usually affords a criterion). A good start has, however, obviously been made. The notorious cardboard factory at Aroma, for instance, has been closed. For the rest, the programme is sound and a lot will depend upon the restoration of the south.

In general, one would advise anybody who is about to visit the Sudan to get hold of a copy of this book and keep it by him.

K.D.D.H.

Book Notes

Educational Planning and Unemployed Youth, by ARCHIBALD CALLAWAY; *UNESCO;* pp. 47; 0.45p.

Professor Callaway has contributed an admirable monograph on a desperately important theme, to UNESCO's Fundamentals of Educational Planning Series.

Mauritius, Ceylon, Guyana, Jamaica, Kenya—there is scarcely a developing country where the quantum of unemployment among young people and in particular among better educated youth is not appallingly high. "Concentration on raising growth rates of per capita income is not enough, development designs for the 1970s must also provide strategies for creating productive work for the vast numbers of unemployed and under-employed . . . the continued expansion of formal education along existing lines is no longer considered adequate . . . how can educational systems be geared more closely to economic and social realities?"

Economic growth but few jobs can only be regarded as unsatisfactory growth—obviously the faults where man's fallibility is concerned, do not lie with educational policy makers alone. Without the population explosion the economic growth achieved could have provided a very different picture of job creation—the grim phrase "surplus youth" might well have been avoided.

Professor Callaway rightly dismisses as untenable any *laissez faire* policy: rather, as he says "immediate, far-reaching action on many fronts is essential". He lists these as covering (a) reform of the economy—policies to effect the redistribution of the national incomes, the development of employment-creating strategies, close investigation of the advantages of capital intensity and labour intensity in promoting development, transformation of the rural areas and diversification of agriculture, less bias towards the cities, etc., (b) make formal education more relevant—vocational subjects for primary schools, turn rural school leavers into farmers instead of urban immigrants, reform curricula so as to relate to community and national life, step up technical and vocational training, (c) strengthen out-of-school education—increase "functional literacy" for adults, vocational training for school-leavers, develop social and cultural youth programmes, (d) sensibly cautious and qualified support for national youth service programmes, (e) a wider role for educational planners who can contribute (towards the provision of employment opportunities) by reducing the discontinuities between education and the growing economies.

Professor Callaway writes clearly and convincingly and his monograph one feels should be compulsory reading for policy-makers be they ministers, economists, planners or educationalists, in developing countries and for those concerned with aid programmes in donor countries. To emphasise and emphasise again the importance of adequate social input in the content of development planning can no longer be gainsaid.

The Population Council Annual Report for 1970, *The Population Council, New York.*

This exceptionally well produced report provides a full picture of the work undertaken by the Population Council throughout the world. Bernard Berelson, the President, provides a stimulating chapter. There are, as he writes, four broad ways to lower birth rates: (a) involuntary fertility control—but coercion is not really on the horizon; (b) changes in social institutions—modernisation bringing with it realisation by society of the essential need to limit the size of families; (c) incentives and disincentives—social legislation, particularly in the West, tends to be pro-natalist with family allowances, tax deductions for children, housing preferences, etc., and (d) programmes to spread voluntary fertility control—the course adopted most frequently by developing countries. The world population, it is estimated, will increase by over 50 per cent by the end of the century and reach a figure of some 5.8 billion. As the President emphasises "something must be done"—it is to be hoped that this report will help to stimulate increasingly effective action.

International Aspects of Over-Population, Ed. John Barratt and Michael Louw; *Macmillan – St. Martin's Press;* index; pp. 334; £4.50.

Thirteen Professors, a doctor, and a director of an Institute, from Australia, France, Israel, Italy, Japan, the Netherlands, South Africa, and the United States provide the papers included in this volume. The papers were presented at a Conference held in Johannesburg in 1970.

Among the conclusions drawn by the Conference were:

1. The key to the prosperity and power of a country lies in the quality and productivity rather than in the size of its population.
2. It is the moral responsibility of each nation, shared by its government and people, to achieve an improving balance between its population size, food production and ability to purchase necessary imports.
3. Inquiries by inter-disciplinary research teams into the varied reasons why fertility rates are not declining appreciably in less developed countries, and into ways by which motivations and practices might be changed, are urgently needed, and should be undertaken on a more extensive scale.
4. Because countries with rapidly growing populations find it especially costly to educate their young it is extremely important that research be undertaken on the kinds of education and training required in such countries.

The problem and dangers of over population are now widely recognized throughout the world; what has yet to be evolved in most countries is how to mount and carry out a successful programme of family limitation. 15/20 years must pass before the benefits of any such policy can really accrue and this is one major reason why action is such a global necessity.

Research Report No. 10 – An Evaluation of Kenya Science Teachers' College, by Olga Linne; *The Scandinavian Institute of African Studies*, 1972.

The KST College receives support from Sweden, with the University of Uppsala having the main responsibility for the administration and completion of the project delegated to it by the Swedish International Development Authority, in accordance with the bi-lateral aid agreement between Sweden and Kenya—hence this evaluation study by Dr. Linne.

The College started in provisional buildings and moved to its new buildings in Nairobi in 1968. The annual intake of students has risen from under 50 to over 140. The average age of students is 20-21. An introductory 14 week course is followed by a 32 weeks basic course and the training is completed by a 42 weeks higher course, students completing 7 terms in all. Besides the science subjects taught, the final year sees the student concentrate on professional training—education, teaching methods and teaching practice. Students who graduate are expected to teach in Kenya secondary schools for a minimum of 3 years. The objective is to produce about 150 secondary school teachers per annum.

The author draws favourable tentative conclusions as to the production rate of teachers and to the students' attitudes towards progressive teaching methods and their readiness to use such methods in their schools. She finds, however, that the College has been less successful in providing a wider general knowledge.

This evaluation should prove of marked value to the Swedish and Kenyan authorities and, besides, it may well provide useful guidelines to other donor and recipient governments concerned with aid for secondary school development in less developed countries.

Research Report No. 11 – Who Pays Tax in Kenya, by John R. Nellis; *Scandinavian Institute of African Studies*, 1972; pp. 22.

Kenya is achieving a remarkable degree of economic development, a measure of success well in advance of many other African countries. Of course there are problems, with unemployment perhaps the greatest of all (albeit the author points out that the overall percentage of unemployment is not particularly acute). Because Kenya has adopted a mixed economy, radical political scientists and economists look as cheerfully for faults and cracks as they seek to paper over the failures in other lands where they approve of the politics which unfortunately are not achieving much economic progress.

Mr. Nellis finds himself repeating some of the hearsay and subjective yet scantily supported comments of the critics—though basically there is little doubt he is really sympathetic towards the efforts of the Kenya Government. There is no particular reason why a Kenya income tax official should be regarded as possessing specialist knowledge on the adequacy or otherwise of Kenya social services. Instead of remittances sent home, let government taxes be heavier and state services larger. This sounds fine in theory. To ensure in practice that increased state revenue can be shared out effectively to all rural areas subsumes a degree of administrative competence rarely found in developed or developing lands.

There is a rather sketchy summary of local government taxation and a not altogether accurate account of the emasculation of County Councils early in 1970 (no mention of present hopes of the restoration of some of their powers).

Africans do contribute in tax and/or kind to local self-help schemes and have long done so. That some pressure is exerted is also true. Complaint that payments go into private pockets are no more justified than the popular fallacy that an expatriate DC pocketed the taxes and was thereby enabled to buy a safari car.

Mr. Nellis concludes that Kenyan peasants and workers are not overly hard hit by Kenya taxation. However, he seems to remain convinced that there is exploitation and intends to seek confirmation for his suspicions in the commercial sector of the economy, having failed to justify them in the public sector.

British Tanganyika, by ROBERT HEUSSLER; *Duke University Press, North Carolina;* glossary, map, index; pp. 154; $6.75.

Writing with a kindly, sympathetic and perceptive pen, Robert Heussler provides an admirable sketch of district administration in Tanganyika during the League of Nations Mandate period up to the first years of United Nations Trusteeship. His own essays will bring back many nostalgic memories to all those of his readers who have served in East Africa—and he deserves a very full readership from this source alone. In all, British rule extended for only 40 years and as Heussler points out the early intake of administrative officers during and immediately after World War One were a mixed bag—of widely varying aptitudes and capacities, before Ralph Furse organized recruitment and the Oxbridge flow of cadets began. That an author could have taken such immense pains in his researching and his interviewing and then confined himself to a mere 70 pages of personal description speaks a very great deal for his self-discipline and a modesty that preferred a selection of contemporary records to speak for themselves. He shows an understanding of difficult working conditions in the Twenties that many later officials who enjoyed air-conditioning and refrigerators, landrovers and radios, failed to appreciate when they looked askance at some of their predecessors' actions.

The excerpts of selected papers make interesting reading for the general reader besides Africanists and scholars. Extracts from the Rungwe annual report of 1940 hide how rapidly progress was to come—nine years later the Council of Chiefs was to be replaced by a Council with a majority of directly elected members. This is a book the reviewer commends and would like to see available in the secondary schools of Tanzania as valuable factual apolitical history.

How Revolutionary is the Green Revolution? by INGRID PALMER; *Voluntary Committee on Overseas Aid and Development, London;* pp. 30; 15p.

Fifteen pence is well worth spending in order to read Guy Hunter's thoughtful and stimulating Foreword. He agrees with the author that the new technology of the green revolution can be adopted more readily by the "larger, richer, better educated farmers", that if increased output brings reduced prices, these the bigger efficient farmer can sustain, but not so the little man. We are however concerned here with newly independent developing countries—sovereign states such as India that "cannot be manipulated, from inside or outside, like a rowing boat".

Miss Palmer is a reformer and she points out the varied social problems and some of the economic problems created by the green revolution. She is right to warn against blind optimism that the new seed varieties will create a rapid rural utopia—but it is surely nonsense so to exaggerate as to say that they provide "an open invitation to much greater malnutrition, starvation and anarchy"—such a threat is not likely to aid the cause of VCOAD. The author one hopes will ponder on Guy Hunter's final words—change there is, inevitably so, what it will bring history will tell, but whatever the dangers "before the scientists brought the new seeds to Asia, there was not even a winning chance".

The Green Revolution, by Stanley Johnson; *Hamish Hamilton;* illustrated, index; pp. 218; £2.75.

"The Green Revolution" may or may not have become a cliché, but to most people concerned with development in the Third World, it relates to a very real possibility that the spectre of famine on a vast and terrible scale can at least be deferred if not finally avoided as the greatest of all human problems in the last quarter of the Twentieth Century.

The author of this book does not, despite its title, concentrate on the possibilities of new varieties of seeds. It is to be hoped that other parts of his travelogue—written in a sort of racy journalese, is more accurate and less patronising (on Africans and expatriates alike) than the pages on Tanzania with its absurd reference to a thousand expatriate families once living in Dodoma town (the context does not imply Asian families), and a garbled wrongly-dated version of the murder of a young Williamson's Diamonds surveyor near Kigwe just outside Dodoma. Drought alas, is truly the scourge of Ugogo, but in good years it is the centre of a very productive area—and even in drought years the new extensive vineyards flourish—but these apparently the author failed to see.

World Development Handbook, by Juliet Clifford and Gavin Osmand; *Charles Knight for the Overseas Development Institute;* tables, appendices, index; pp. 172 £1.50.

ODI have produced a useful handbook about developing the Third World—but—hence of course the title—all the World is involved. The authors begin "most people in the world live in poor countries"—a fact no doubt but their chapter on "A Poor World" over-simplifies the issues; one could infer that staggering poverty cannot exist in developed countries or equally ignore that quite a lot of people in developing countries lack neither food nor medical services—whatever else they may lack.

Over the years ODI has set a very high standard for itself in the quality of its paperbacks on a wide variety of overseas development topics—and this, perhaps, is why one feels that this particular volume does not quite measure up to the expected level. There is, however, plenty of interesting information, particularly in the Tables forming Appendix 1.

Shirley Baker and the King of Tonga, by Noel Rutherford; *Oxford University Press;* notes, bibliography and index; pp. 202; £5.25.

On the outskirts of Pangai, on Lifuka in the Ha'apai group, stands the statue of Shirley Baker—a few very minor repairs and it would be as good as new. Shirley Baker was the most remarkable European ever to settle in the friendly islands of the Kingdom of Tonga. None can doubt that but for his efforts Tonga would certainly have become a British or possibly a German colony instead of maintaining her independence while enjoying a special treaty relationship with Britain.

Premier, Minister of Finance, trusted servant of King George Tupou who reigned from 1820 until his death in 1893, Shirley Baker drafted a liberal constitution including many of the principles later enshrined in the United Nations Charter.

Baker's background was obscure, his education limited, his conduct far from saintly, his enemies—in particular fellow Wesleyans, British traders and officials were many—

and there were Tongans, too. Determined, no doubt brash at times, he served his King well—the Wolsey perhaps of Tonga—not the Beckett.

Noel Rutherford is to be congratulated on producing this most readable yet scholarly biography which at last provides a balanced picture of Baker—warts and all.

That Tonga remained a free, God-fearing, small happy nation, where the people to this day respond with astonishing generosity to the needs of their Churches—both in cash and in kind, where literacy (in Tongan) has been provided for all children for almost as long as it has in Britain, where it is still a crime to work on the sabbath, where drunkenness is held in check—this and more, result very largely from the formulative years, the last half century of the Victorian era during much of which a powerful veteran King and his unusual Minister from the West, provided a very unusual and largely successful form of government.

This is a book that should appeal to the general reader, to all interested in travel and in the Pacific area. It will also provide scholars with a source of valuable information on the evolution of modern Tonga.

Fred Burnaby's "A Ride to Khiva", edited and introduced by David Williams; *Charles Knight*, 1972; map, index; pp. 149; £2.25.

Mary Kingsley's "Travels in West Africa", edited and introduced by R. Glynn Grylls; *Charles Knight*, 1972; map, index; pp. 118; £2.50.

Two most enjoyable and contrasting travelogues appear in the Charles Knight series "Makers of Empire". Admirable editing by David Williams provides a short and highly entertaining vignette of Victorian history—Fred Burnaby's escapade—one could almost so describe his remarkable journey through Russia to Khiva. A tough, daring, adventurous soldier who, typical of many of his travelling contemporaries from Britain, viewed foreigners and obstacles with almost equal contempt—the unstoppable Englishman in action, Burnaby is able to provide a rare on-the-spot report of how the Russian bear was assuming a modern mantle and pushing his way South Eastwards towards the borders of the Indian Empire. His account of his meeting with the local Chieftain whose lands had recently been annexed, make one realise that there was a grab going on (with Russia facing no competition) for the undeveloped expanses of Asia as there was for the continent of Africa. Full of faith and self-assurance, Burnaby as David Williams tells us, was even able to contest Joseph Chamberlain's Birmingham constituency and run him to a margin of 4,000 in the 35,000 votes polled. He was killed in action with Wolseley's relief expedition Khartoum-bound, a few days before Gordon, too, was speared. As Burnaby lay dying a young private cried out to a brother officer, "here is the bravest man in England, dying . . ." and in the editor's view it would, at any rate, "be hard to find anyone with a greater share of reckless courage".

In complete contrast to the soldier with his braggadocio was the much greater figure of Mary Kingsley—traveller, naturalist and anthropologist. She was a vivid and humorous writer, she was tough and exceedingly observant. She cared about justice and this evoked her strong criticism of Colonial governments' actions towards Africans for whom she often assumed the role of champion—vigorously opposing, for example, the hut tax introduced by the metropolitan power. Miss Grylls provides a stimulating introduction to Mary Kingsley's own story which, as with Burnaby's book, has been excellently edited; it is one of the best of all the Victorian travel books on Africa.

Both these volumes provide charm and entertainment and portray two remarkable Victorian characters—each brave and determined. They both deserve a very wide readership.

Planning the Development of Universities, Ed. Victor A. Ohushkin; *UNESCO;* diagrams, tables and appendices; pp. 319; £2.10.

This volume contains a summarized report of the seminar on planning the development of Universities organized in 1969 by the International Institute of Educational Planning. Included are two case studies, the first on the University of Leningrad and the second on the University of Sussex.

Eboue, by BRIAN WEINSTEIN; *Oxford University Press;* bibliography and index; pp. 320; £4.00.

Brian Weinstein is a notable Africanist scholar, admirably qualified to be the English language biographer of France's outstanding war-time Colonial Governor. While colleagues dithered, the one waiting for another to make up his mind, fearing the consequences of precipitate action, Eboue was unafraid and boldly declared for de Gaulle in the black days following the fall of France in 1940. A French citizen of Cayenne whose great-grandparents had come from Africa's Ivory Coast, it was unusual that a black Creole chose to become a Colonial official in Africa. A successful and progressively-minded administrator, he rose in the service to become Governor of Guadaloupe. His recall and posting to Chad was a humiliating and politically-inspired demotion, but this is the story with a happy ending—the Governor of Chad became General de Gaulle's Governor-General and his name will live on the roll of honour of those who bravely took up the cause of the Free French.

From Crisis to Crisis – Pakistan 1962-1969, by HERBERT FELDMAN *Oxford University Press,* 1972; appendices, index; pp. 340; £5.50.

Growth and Inequality in Pakistan, Eds. KEITH GRIFFIN and AZIZOR RAHMAN KHAN; *Macmillan,* 1972; index; pp. 281; £5.25.

Herbert Feldman's story covers the decade of Ayub Khan's government in Pakistan and is very largely a political study of the General's fortunes while in office, from his rise to undisputed presidential power until his sudden downfall. Feldman points to the Kashmir adventure as the turning point; the army may have acquitted itself well, but the Head of State was seen (albeit wisely) to turn back from the chosen path of war and to agree to terms at Tashkent that savoured of submission to Russian pressure and acquiescence to Indian demands. With mounting student unrest on the one hand and increasing opposition from political leaders who included service men besides civilians on the other, the General seems to have seen no joy or purpose in continuing in office and unexpectedly threw in the towel. Certainly he furthered the economic development of Pakistan (the donor consortium certainly reported well on his co-operation), certainly his Rural Works Programme achieved results for backward rural areas, certainly his Basic Democracies (maybe insufficiently democratic) provided a forum for popular participation and a base for the Rural Works undertaken—for these history may well accord Ayub Khan good marks and perhaps his reluctance to carry on was due to a reluctance to use the force needed so to do; if so, then further marks will need to be awarded.

Messrs. Griffiths and Khan together with their fellow contributors provide ten chapters, each a study of a particular facet of Pakistan's post independence development—under the principal headings of development strategy, stagnation and growth in agriculture, industry and trade, and wages, income distribution and savings.

The authors are economists who go along with the new look towards GNP (post—the Seers Mission to Colombia, post—the 1970 Cambridge Conference on Development) believing that "growth targets as such will become meaningless" since the main objective—for planners *et al*—is to reduce poverty and inequality.

The particular value of this volume probably lies in the way in which the authors explain the economic origins of the Free Bengal movement—thence to Civil War and the creation of Bangladesh.

Conflict, Crisis and War in Pakistan, by KALIM SIDDIQUE; *Macmillan,* 1972; notes, appendix, index; pp. 216; £2.95.

The author is a Pakistani who has lived in Britain since 1954 save for the months in 1969-70 when he returned and obtained much of the information and impressions which he conveys in this book. He overdoes it a little when he claims his disillusionment with independent Pakistan dates from 1948 when he was just 15, but he has certainly developed the strongest distaste for the type of police-state despotism that was evolved during the Ayub Khan regime and which continued up to the tragedy of the Civil War from which independent Bangladesh has emerged.

He expresses an enlightened view on the political and social situation in Pakistan since independence. He is less than generous in his assessment of Indian policies and attitudes; all in all this book amounts to a useful contemporary picture of Pakistan and her ills, told in tolerable language—a little smug and cocksure at times, no work of scholarship but fair journalism.

Studies in Economics and Economic History, Ed. MARCELLE KOOY; *Macmillan;* notes and index; pp. 313; £5.00.

Ten scholars, economists, economic historians and historians, from South Africa, Italy, the United States and Britain, each contribute a chapter to this volume produced in honour of Professor R. H. Robertson on his retirement after 20 years as Professor of Economics at the University of Capetown.

The reader, who will find a wide variety of interest is catered for by these essays: The Law and the Hottentot in the 1820s, slow economic growth in late 18th-century France, the Industrial revolution, secret price-cutting in Oligopoly, besides economic studies of South Africa's economic development.

Printed in England for HER MAJESTY'S STATIONERY OFFICE
by Adams & Sons (Printers) Ltd., East Street, Hereford.
Dd 503225 K16 11/72